English-Indonesian Subtitling Strategies Used in Paterson Movie

Putri Widyaningsih[1], I Nyoman Tri Ediwan[2], Ni Ketut Sri Rahayuni[3]

[123]English Department - Faculty of Humanities - Udayana University
Denpasar, Bali, Indonesia
putri.widya2929@gmail.com[1], tri_ediwan@hotmail.com[2], ketutsrirahayuni@gmail.com[3]

Abstract The purpose of this study was to identify and analyze the subtitling strategies based on Gottlieb (1992) translation theory and the translation accuracy according to translation theory by Larson (1998: 530) in the Paterson movie. This study used descriptive-qualitative method to analyze the data and documentation method applied to collect the data. Based on the results of the study, it can be concluded that there were 389 data found in Paterson movie with transfer (129 data), paraphrase (93 data), deletion (59 data), condensation (55 data), imitation (21 data), Expansion (17 data), decimation (14 data), and resignation (1 data). However, there were no transcription and dislocation strategies that had found in the Paterson subtitle translation. Meanwhile, for the translation accuracy, the findings show there were 281 out of 389 data that the translator translated it accurately, and 108 out of 389 data inaccurate translation. Therefore, the Indonesian subtitle of "Paterson" movie was categorized as an accurate translation text.

I. INTRODUCTION

Audio Visual Translation is a subset of several translation forms. Audiovisual translation is currently mostly done by translators when a film is dubbed. Nowadays, the film industry really needs to face a translation problem, as only a small percentage of the world's population can understand foreign languages, such as English as an example, particularly in Indonesia. Therefore, this kind of translation is required to avoid any misunderstandings when translating the source language into the target language.

As Catford (1965: 20) described that translation is a method of exchanging textual information from one language (SL) with similar textual material in another language (TL), the translator should prevent misinterpretation of context, while translating the source language to the target language, and the translator should decide that the text may not consist of a different meaning or losing the true meaning. According to Larson (1998: 529) in every translated sentence, the translator needs to improve the quality of text by checking the accuracy, clarity, and naturalness. To avoid any mistakes in the analysis of the source text or transfer process into target language, the translator need to carefully check the translation accuracy. Besides, the translated text must also establish equivalent meanings between English and Indonesian because the systems and grammatical structures of the two are different, so accuracy is needed in translation activity as Nababan et al. (2012: 50) conveyed the accuracy aspect refers to the equivalence between SL and TL, and this equivalence refers to the similarity of content or messages between the two. If a text has the same meaning or message as other text, it can be called a translation. Therefore, in order to minimise the risks of errors in transferring the messages from the movie scene, an audiovisual translation or audiovisual translation (AVT) activity is needed.

Audiovisual translation (AVT) refers to the transition from one language of audiovisual works and objects to another language component. As the name implies, audiovisual translation can be heard and seen at the same time, but mainly to be seen. The audiovisual translation method that converts audio into visible text is called subtitles. Díaz-Cintas and Remael (2014: 8) conveyed subtitles as a type of translation, which involves projecting the text on the lower part of the screen, with the purpose of restating the original speaker's dialogue and the utterance elements that appear on the screen, and also the details found in the sound that can be heard in the movie. To translate the movie's subtitle, the translator usually using the ten strategies which are expansion, paraphrase, transfer, imitation, transcription, dislocation, condensation, decimation, deletion, and resignation can be used in translation activities that conveyed by Gottlieb (cited in Ghaemi and Benyamin 2010: 42). This research focused on

the English and Indonesian subtitles of a drama-romance movie entitled "Paterson" directed by Jim Jarmusch in 2016, which was downloaded from the Internet. In order to find the context from the original language to the target language in conversations or written text without changing the original dialog in the movie, this research had analyzed the subtitling techniques and the accuracy of translation used in the subtitles script while the previous studies only analyzed subtitling strategies and translation acceptability of the subtitle movie.

II. METHOD AND THEORY

A. Method

This study used qualitative descriptive method, which was explanation about existing linguistic facts (Sudaryanto, 1993). This method was used to classify and describe the phenomena of translation, especially on the translation strategies used in English and Indonesian subtitle text of Paterson (2016) movie and the translation accuracy of the subtitle movie. The primary data of this research were obtained from the movie entitled "Paterson" directed and written by Jim Jarmusch in 2016, the secondary data of this research were obtained from the English movie script by Jim Jarmusch and Indonesian subtitle script translated by Dhika Andhina Kusuma Wardhani.

To collect the data, this research used documentation method by watching the movie and read the subtitle script. There were three steps used in collecting the data. First was watching the "Paterson" movie a few times to grasp all the stories in order to get the meaning of each scene. The second step was downloading the English movie script and Indonesian subtitle script in order to understand the context and the meaning of the data. The last step was to pay attention to the target language and source language of the movie that contains the subtitle strategy in the source language subtitles of the script and take a note of the subtitle texts.

This research used descriptive-qualitative method to analyze the translation strategies by Gottlieb (1992) and the translation accuracy according to Larson (1989) in the English-Indonesian subtitle text of "Paterson" movie. The data were analyzed through some steps. The first step was classifying and categorizing the subtitling strategies based on ten classifications proposed by Gottlieb (1992). Second step, find the subtitle strategies in the movie. The last step was analyzed the accuracy of the subtitle texts and drawing the conclusions based on the result.

B. Translation Strategies by Gottlieb (1992)

Translation's subtitle is a translation process from a verbal to a written language or in a text form to transform the source language to the target language without modifying the actual meaning. A translator needs to listen to the audio that will change into text which is placed in the subtitle box at the bottom of the screen. The ten subtitle strategies that can be applied are expansion, paraphrase, transfer, imitation, transcription, dislocation, condensation, decimation, deletion, and resignation.

TABLE I
TRANSLATION STRATEGIES BY GOTTLIEB (1992)

Translation Strategy	Explanation
Expansion	When the translator thinks that the original subtitles cannot be retrieved or translated into the target language and need more explanation, this strategy can describe the ideas of original meaning in the source language.
Paraphrase	When transferring meaning from the original language (SL) to another language (TL), if the translator does not use the same grammatical rules, translator use paraphrase strategy to translate the text. Paraphrase made the subtitle is easy to understand with the translator changed the syntactical form of SL into an understandable form in TL without changing the original meaning.
Transfer	Transfer strategy is a translation process in which the source language is changed to the target language completely and precisely by the translator. There is no added description or modification of the view, since the translator converts the dialog into a literal phrase. In addition, the use of this technique often preserves the structure of the original text.
Imitation	Imitation is a technique that preserves the same structure of SL. This technique generally extends to the translator when dealing with proper nouns, such as the names of places and persons.
Transcription	Transcription is used to deal with unusual terms, incomprehensible language, or third language in the source text.
Dislocation	Dislocation is often used when there are any special

Condensation	effects, such as a song in the source text, that are more important than the translation content. Condensation is a strategy to produce a shorter text by eliminating some of the redundancies automatically and thereby enhances coherence for the audience text to solve the issue of line captioning. Sometimes a pragmatic effect may be lost by the use of a condensation technique. The true meaning of the text must therefore be conveyed.
Decimation	Decimation is the severe type of condensation or extensive reduction of the message followed by a reduction of its important expression and elements. It's usually used when actors quarrel with quick talk. Since the utterances are too difficult to comprehend, because they are too fast, the translator has to condense the text to make it easier to understand. This strategy also used to omitting some taboo words.
Deletion	Deletion is deleting certain sections of the text, such as repetition, filler, and question tag. It refers to the entire elimination of sections of the text.
Resignation	Resignation defines the strategy adopted when the issue of translation cannot be overcome. During the process, the meaning of the source text can be lost.

C. Translation Accuracy Assessment Instrument

Accuracy is an important aspect for translator to translate a language. The translator should pay attention to the accuracy of translating to keep the quality of the translation text. According to Larson (1998: 529) in every translated sentences, the translator need to improving the quality of text with checking the accuracy, clarity, and naturalness. Sometimes, the translator have to working so hard to restructuring the translation text. The translator need to getting across the meaning and adding some information which was not really in the source text. This information

will need to be deleted. To avoid any mistakes in analysis the source text or transfer process to the target language, the translator need to carefully check the translation accuracy. Based on Larson (1998: 530) he create a translation qualitative assessment model that includes the following assessment of the accuracy of the instrument:

TABLE II
TRANSLATION ACCURACY ASSESSMENT INSTRUMENT

Translation Accuracy	Explanation
Accurate	The message of the source text is completely transferred to the target text, and the sentences in the translation are not distorted or reordered. This means that in translation activities, the translator should find a way to properly convey the meaning of the actual message from the source text into the target text. There is no omission or addition of words in conveying the meaning of the word being translated, and ensuring that the meaning are true.
Inaccurate	The message of the source text is conveyed imprecisely. If any distortions and discrepancies were found on the translation text, it can be assumed that inaccuracy occurred in the translation. There are several ways for evaluating the inaccurate translation: One, certain elements that were not in the original text were added. Second, the original and translated texts have different meanings. Third, several parts that were in the original text were omitted. The last, there is a zero meaning (the translation form used does not communicate any meaning at all) when the translator translating the text.

III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

A. Subtitling Strategies used in Paterson Movie based on Gottlieb (1992) Translation Strategies

Gottlieb (1992) conveyed there are ten translation strategies that can be used for translation activities, they are expansion, paraphrase, transfer, imitation, transcription, dislocation, condensation, decimation, deletion, and resignation.

TABLE III
TRANSLATION STRATEGIES BY GOTTLIEB (1992) USED IN PATERSON
MOVIE

Number	Translation Strategy	Data
1.	Transfer	129
2.	Paraphrase	93
3.	Deletion	59
4.	Condensation	55
5.	Imitation	21
6.	Expansion	17
7.	Decimation	14
8.	Resignation	1
9.	Transcripstion	0
10.	Dislocation	0
	Total	389

Table 3 above presented the translation strategies in Paterson subtitle text based on the frequency of occured data. This study found eight out of ten strategies that the translator has used when translated Paterson movie from English into Indonesian, they were transfer, paraphrase, condensation, deletion, Expansion, imitation, decimation, and resignation. The strategies that mostly appeared in this movie was transfer strategy with 129 out of 389 data, and the least is resignation strategy with 1 out of 389 data. From the table, there were not transcription and dislocation strategies used in translation activities on Paterson movie. The eight strategies that had been found in this study are described in the explanation below.

a. *Transfer*
Datum Number 355
(01:25:20 - 01:25:22)
SL: **He threatened to shoot himself.**
TL: ***Dia mengancam untuk menembak dirinya sendiri.***

The utterance in datum number 355 presented from the scene when Paterson was talking with his wife, Laura about what happened in the Doc's bar. The translator used transfer strategy because there were no addition in explanation or modifying of view, because the translator translates the dialogue by literal word. It can be seen from the utterance *He threatened to shoot himself* and translated directly into *Dia mengancam untuk menembak dirinya sendiri* that the translator accurately translated each word in the text by passing the literal meaning in every each word, and successed on maintaining the source language form.

b. *Paraphrase*
Datum Number 53

(00:15:34 - 00:15:37)
SL: I'm **getting my ass kicked** today.
TL: jadi ***bulan-bulanan*** hari ini.

The utterance in datum number 53 was presented from the scene when Doc told Paterson that he had lost many times when he was playing chess, the sentence *getting my ass kicked* in the source language was from an idiom *get someone ass kicked* which is has meaning of to be defeated easily or completely. In this context, the idiom referred to the loss of a game because Doc said to Paterson that he repeatedly defeated when he was playing chess, which was chess is a game. However, it was different from the way the translator translated the idiom into the target language, because the translator changed it into *bulan-bulanan* for easy to understand. Even though the actual meaning was different from the source language, but it still had a similar context, because they all mean things that someone who experience bad or negative things repeatedly and losing are always related to the negative things.

c. *Deletion*
Datum Number 71
(00:20:48 - 00:20:50)
SL: I'm, **you know**, tired, I'm having a beer, **all right?**
TL: ***Aku lelah, aku minum bir.***

The datum number 71 presented from the scene when Paterson was driving a bus and hear two guy who talking with each other. The translator used deletion strategy with omitted two words in the source language when transfered it into target language. The word *you know* and *alright?* was omitted because they were filler words. There is no meaning in those two words because they were used for giving marks a pause or hesitation in their conversation, so that the translator only translated the part *I'm tired, I'm having a beer* and become *Aku lelah, aku minum bir* in the target language.

d. *Condensation*
Datum Number 62
(00:19:00 - 00:19:02)
SL: My kid needs braces ***on her teeth.***
TL: ***Anakku butuh kawat gigi.***

The datum number 62 was presented from the scene when Paterson listened to his friend's problem about his child who need braces. The translator used condensation strategy to translated *My kid needs braces on her teeth* into *Anakku butuh kawat gigi* in the target language. The phrase *on her teeth* was omitted by the translator because the meaning of the word *braces* in the source language is a set of wires that connected to a person's teeth to gradually move them to straighten the teeth, and it already intended

to be worn on the teeth. In order to made the utterance in the target language more effective and easier to understand, the translator no longer needed to translate the phrase literally by translated it word by word.

e. *Imitation*

Data number 261

(00:49:34 - 00:49:42)

SL: Yeah, he, um, he co-founded this anarchist newspaper here in Paterson, but it was in Italian,

um, called **La Questione Sociale.**

TL: Ya, dia, um, mendirikan koran anarkis di Paterson, tapi dalam bahasa Italia, um bernama ***La Questione Sociale.***

In the datum number 261, the scene was from two young couple who was talking about Gaetano Bresci, an Italian anarchist lived in Paterson while they were in the bus. The subtitling case above shows the implementation of imitation subtitling strategy. The translator used imitation strategy to maintain the same form of the phrase *La Questione Sociale* from SL to TL because *La Questione Sociale* is the name of Italian anarchist newspaper that published in Paterson, New Jersey.

f. *Expansion*

Datum Number 333

(01:19:38 - 01:19:40)

SL: Just for **emergencies**.

TL: Hanya untuk ***keadaan darurat***.

In datum number 333, the utterance was presented from the scene when Paterson was talking with his wife about having a handphone. The translator used the expansion strategy to translate the utterance above. It can be seen in the word *emergencies* in the source language, and the translator translated it into *keadaan darurat* in target language. The expansion strategy was used when the translator further explains the phrase *emergency* which is a critical, unexpected, and frequently is life threatening circumstance that necessitates immediate action. The translator added the word *keadaan* on *keadaan darurat* to clarify the meaning of the phrase and also made the translation more natural to understand.

g. *Decimation*

Data Number 89

(00:21:55 - 00:21:58)

SL: - Larry had a barbecue?

- **Yeah, the barbecue party.**

TL: - Larry mengadakan pesta barbekue?

- ***Ya.***

In datum number 89, the utterance was presented from the same scene in datum 74. The utterance *Yeah, the barbecue party* translated into the word *Ya* in target language. From this datum, it can be seen that the translator used decimation strategy to translate because the translator omitted the phrase *the barbecue party*. The translator did not translate the source text literally to make the text briefer, and also this datum was a continuation of the conversation between the two guys that were talking about a barbecue party at Larry's house. The removal of the phrase the barbecue party was also to avoid a repetition of sentences to make them shorter and denser. Nevertheless, the meaning of the text still understandable.

h. *Resignation*

Datum Number 255

(00:43:27 - 00:43:29)

SL: Later, **pimpin'**!

TL: Sampai nanti, ***njing***!

In datum number 255, the utterance came from the scene when Paterson was talking with young men who did rap in the laundry place while he was walking out with his dog. The translator decided to use resignation in the word *pimpin'* and translated into *njing* in the target language because the word *pimpin'* is a slang word, but in the context of conversation there is nothing suitable for use in. There was no solution to translate the word, thus the translator translated the word *pimpin'* into the word *dog* which refers to the dog that Paterson carried and the true meaning in source language was lost when the translator translated it into the target language.

B. *Translation Accuracy in Paterson Movie*

To avoid any mistakes in analysis the source text or transfer process to the target language, the translator need to carefully check the translation accuracy. Based on Larson (1998: 530) he create a translation qualitative assessment model that includes the following assessment of the accuracy of the instrument, they are accurate and inaccurate translation.

TABLE IV
TRANSLATION ACCURACY IN PATERSON MOVIE

No.	Translation Accuracy	Data
1	Accurate	281
2	Inaccurate	108
	Total	389

Table 4 above presented the translation Accuracy in Paterson movie. It showed the translation of the subtitle text from English into Indonesian was quite accurate as a whole of the translation text. There were 281 data that are classified as accurate translation because the translator translated the utterance without changing the meaning or complete meaning when transferred the source language into the target language. On the other hand, there were 108 data that contained in the subtitle text of the Paterson movie which classified as an inaccurate translation because there

were some reduction, addition, and omission of the meaning and also some difference meaning and zero meaning in the target language when the translator translated the utterance from the movie.

a. *Accurate*

Datum Number 209

(00:34:34 - 00:34:38)

SL: **Have another drink, Everett, on the house.**

TL: *Tambah lagi, Everett, gratis.*

From the utterance in datum number 209, the translator had been translated it accurately into the target language. It can be seen in the utterance *Have another drink, Everett, on the house* and the translator transferred it into *Tambah lagi, Everett, gratis* in the target language. The sentence *have another drink* in the utterance referred to Doc who offering Everett to order another drink, but the translator made it brief with translated into *tambah lagi* which had the same meaning and in the same context with the scene. On the other hand, the phrase *on the house* is an idiom of something for free that would normally have to be bought, especially in a bar or restaurant, and the translator translated it into *gratis* which had the same meaning with the idiom. Nevertheless, the text in the target language was more brief and natural without changing the meaning of the original text.

b. *Inaccurate*

Datum Number 42

(00:14:28 - 00:14:32)

SL: This is my **brother**, Dave.

TL: Ini *saudaraku*, Dave.

From the utterance in datum number 42, it presented from the scene when Paterson and his friends who had chatting in Doc's bar. From the datum, the translator had decreased the meaning of the word *brother* in the source language. The word *brother* has an equivalent meaning with *saudara laki-laki* in the target language. However, the translator decided to translate the word into *saudara* in the target language that the meaning has decreased because the word *saudara* in Indonesian does not explain the gender of the object intended. So that, the meaning of the source language which means a male who has the same parents as another or one parent in common with another experienced a reduction in the meaning and made it an inaccurate translation when the translator translated into *saudara* in target language.

IV. CONCLUSION

This study was conducted to identify and analyze the subtitling strategies used by the translator to translated the Paterson Movie based on Gottlieb (1992) translation strategies and analyze how was the translation accuracy in the movie based on Larson (1998: 530) theory. The findings show that there are eight out of ten translation strategies

used in the subtitle translation of Paterson Movie, they are transfer (129 data), paraphrase (93 data), deletion (59 data), condensation (55 data), imitation (21 data), Expansion (17 data), decimation (14 data), and resignation (1 data). The strategies that mostly appeared in this movie is transfer with 131 out of 389 data, and the least is resignation with 1 out of 389 data. However, there were no transcription and dislocation strategies that had found in the Paterson subtitle translation.

On the other hand, there are two categories for the translation accuracy, those are accurate and inaccurate. The findings show there are 281 out of 389 data that the translator translated it accurately, and 108 out of 389 data inaccurate translation. According to the findings, the Indonesian subtitle of "Paterson" movie was categorized as accurate, it means the translator translated the subtitle with complete meaning without changing the context meaning with addition and omission. The subtitle can easily understand by the audience because of the meaning of the source language had translated accurately by the translator. Even there were any inaccurate translation in the subtitle translation, the translator translated the text into the target language as close as possible as the meaning of the source language so that there is no misinterpretation and misconception about the real meaning.

REFERENCES

[1] Catford, J.C. (1965). *A linguistic theory of translation; an essay in applied linguistics*. London, Oxford University Press.

[2] Coehl, L.J. (2003). *Subtitling and Dubbing: Restrictions and Priorities*. [Internet]. www.translationdirectory.com. Available from: https://www.translationdirectory.com/article326.htm [Accessed 7 November 2020].

[3] Díaz-Cintas, J. and Remael, A. (2014). *Audiovisual translation: subtitling*. Abingdon, UK; New York, USA: Routledge.

[4] Fathi, M. and Moghimizadeh, R.P. (2014). An Analysis of English Subtitling of Verbal Cultural Signs in the 'A Separation' Iranian Film. *International Journal of English Education*, 3(3), pp.142–156.

[5] Febryanto, T. (2014). *Meaning Accuracy of the English Idiomatic Expressions of The Iron Man 3 Movie Text in the Bahasa Indonesia Subtitling Text*. (thesis). Yogyakarta State University, Yogyakarta.

[6] Ghaemi, F., & Benyamin, J. (2010). Strategies Used in the Translation of Interlingual Subtitling. *Journal Of English Studies*, 1(1), pp.39–49.

[7] Gottlieb, H. (1992). Subtitling: A new university discipline. In: C. Dollerup & A. Loddegaard (Eds.), *Teaching translation and interpreting: training, talent and experience*, pp.161 - 170. Amsterdam & Philadelphia: John Benjamins.

[8]   Hosseinnia, M. (2014). Strategies in subtitling English cartoons or animations. *International Journal of Language Learning and Applied Linguistics World*, 5(3), pp.128–135.

[9]   Larson, M. (1998). *Meaning-based translation*. Second Edition. Lanham, Md.: University Press of America.

[10]   Latif, M.A. (2018). Translation Techniques in and Accuracy of The Indonesian Subtitles of The Movie Philomena. *ELT Forum: Journal of English Language Teaching*, 7(1), pp.1–14.

[11]   Mcloughlin, L.I. et al. (2011). *Audiovisual translation : subtitles and subtitling : theory and practice*. Oxford, UK: Peter Lang.

[12]   Nababan, M. et al. (2012). Pengembangan Model Penilaian Kualitas Terjemahan. *Kajian Linguistik dan Sastra*, 24(1), pp.39–57.

[13]   Puri, D.A.L. and Pasaribu, T.A. (2019). PUBG Fansubtitle: Strategies nd Translation Acceptability. *Journal of language and Literature*, 19(02), pp.126–139.

[14]   Sudaryanto. (1993). *Metode dan Aneka Teknik Analisis Bahasa: Pengantar Penelitian Wahana Kebudayaan secara Linguistis*. Yogyakarta: Duta Wacana University Press.