

# Towards Quality and Sustainable Tourism in Bali: Should the Regional Master Plan be Adjusted?

**I Dewa Gede Palguna\***

Faculty of Law, Udayana University, Denpasar, Indonesia

**Anak Agung Gede Duwira Hadi Santosa\*\***

Faculty of Law, Udayana University, Denpasar, Indonesia

**Made Maharta Yasa\*\*\***

Faculty of Law, Udayana University, Denpasar, Indonesia

**I Gede Pasek Pramana\*\*\*\***

Faculty of Law, Udayana University, Denpasar, Indonesia

---

## Abstract

Bali is the area in Indonesia that is most affected economically due to the paralysis of the tourism industry during the Covid-19 Pandemic. Consequently, tourism development programs designed by the government faced many obstacles in their implementation. This article discusses how the concept of quality and sustainable tourism are incorporated into the Tourism Master Plan of the Bali Province 2015-2029. Further, it evaluates the implementation of the master plan during the Covid-19 Pandemic. This writing is designed based on legal research that applies a policy-oriented approach. The research collected and analyzed primary sources in the form of law, regulation, and policy at the national and regional levels, as well as secondary sources that are available in textbooks, journal articles, and website content. A series of qualitative interviews and a focus group discussion were conducted to deepen understanding of legal and non-legal matters. This article suggested that even though the concept of quality and sustainable tourism has been incorporated into the aforementioned master plan, the document implies a contradiction between the vision that desires to apply the concept and the goals and objectives which tend to support quantity tourism. The qualitative evaluation indicated that the master plan could not be appropriately implemented and requires an adjustment to bring in again the vision into the implementing policy adopted by the provincial government.

**Keywords:** Quality and Sustainable Tourism; Master Plan; Policy; Bali.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The Covid-19 pandemic has adversely impacted the tourism sector.<sup>1</sup> Policies of lockdown, closed borders, restrictions, and isolation adopted by many countries worldwide paralyzed this sector tragically. A promising hope was raised when the vaccination program and implementation of health

---

\* Email/Corresponding Author: [dewa\\_palguna@unud.ac.id](mailto:dewa_palguna@unud.ac.id)

\*\* Email: [agung\\_santosa@unud.ac.id](mailto:agung_santosa@unud.ac.id)

\*\*\*Email: [maharta\\_yasa@unud.ac.id](mailto:maharta_yasa@unud.ac.id)

\*\*\*Email: [pasek\\_pramana@unud.ac.id](mailto:pasek_pramana@unud.ac.id)

<sup>1</sup> Noga Collins-Kreiner and Yael Ram, "National Tourism Strategies during the Covid-19 Pandemic," *Annals of Tourism Research* 89 (2021): 2.

protocols gradually increased the confidence of tourism stakeholders to restart their activities. When the immigration border began to reopen, efforts to restore the tourism sub-systems and resume tourism-related business were intensified.

In accelerating the tourism economy recovery, governments in tourist destinations plan a series of initiatives.<sup>2</sup> It cannot be denied that economic policy response to Covid-19 influences tourism recovery.<sup>3</sup>

Tourism policy is not merely about the concern for economic interests. It can be described as measures adopted and actions taken by the government to regulate the ecological, socio-cultural, and economic impacts of the tourism industry.<sup>4</sup> As tourism relies on resources available in tourism destinations (e.g., environment and socio-cultural aspects), policy development, implementation process, and long-term strategic planning require the participation of stakeholders to bring about sustainable tourism.<sup>5</sup> The formulation and implementation of sustainable tourism policies have been subjected to significant uncertainties, especially in light of globalization trends that have impacted local government decisions.<sup>6</sup>

Bali is a world tourism destination that was significantly affected by the pandemic. Data in September 2021, a year and a half after the pandemic, shows that Bali is the most affected region in Indonesia experienced IDR 51 trillion in Gross Domestic Product (GDP) losses.<sup>7</sup> Bali faced a dramatic decline in the economy since 60% of its GDP is associated with the tourism industry.<sup>8</sup> Local residents expected the tourism recovery policy in Bali would spur the economy by stimulating the chains of the tourism industry.

The tourism recovery efforts are obviously conducted without comprehensive evaluation by tourism stakeholders in Bali. Also, there seems to be neither introspection nor reflection on Bali's economic, social, cultural, and environmental resilience in dealing with unexpected situations. In this context, there is a need to evaluate the Bali tourism development plan.

This article discusses how the concept of quality and sustainable tourism are incorporated into the Tourism Master Plan of the Bali Province 2015-2029 (Bali's Tourism Master Plan). Further, it evaluates the

---

<sup>2</sup> Jose Weng Chou Wong and Ivan Ka Wai Lai, "The Mechanism Influencing the Residents' Support of the Government Policy for Accelerating Tourism Recovery under COVID-19," *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management* 52 (2022): 219.

<sup>3</sup> Luke Okafor, Usman Khalid, and Sasidaran Gopalan, "COVID-19 Economic Policy Response, Resilience and Tourism Recovery," *Annals of Tourism Research Empirical Insights* 3, no. 2 (2022): 2.

<sup>4</sup> See Jenny Suno Wu, Pete Barbrook-Johnson, and Xavier Font, "Participatory Complexity in Tourism Policy: Understanding Sustainability Programmes with Participatory Systems Mapping," *Annals of Tourism Research* 90, (2021): 2.

<sup>5</sup> Yi Guo, Jinbo Jiang, and Shengchao Li, "A Sustainable Tourism Policy Research Review," *Sustainability* 11, no. 11 (2019): 10.

<sup>6</sup> *Ibid.*, 11.

<sup>7</sup> Ya-Yen Sun et.al, "Road to Recovery: Assessing Job Risk and the Impact on the Most Vulnerable in Indonesia's Pandemic-Hit Tourism Industry," Research Report, the Australia-Indonesia Centre (2021), 12.

<sup>8</sup> Maela Madel L. Cahigas et.al, "Factors Affecting Visiting Behavior to Bali during the COVID-19 Pandemic: An Extended Theory of Planned Behavior Approach," *Sustainability* 14 (2022): 2.

implementation of Bali's Tourism Master Plan during the Covid-19 Pandemic. The evaluation results will be used to propose a recommendation for adjusting the master plan.

It is legal research that applies a policy-oriented approach. Primary sources are obtained from law, regulation, and policy at the national and regional levels, while secondary sources are taken from relevant books, journal articles, and website content. The research carried out a series of qualitative interviews on August 18, 2022, with officers of the Bali Provincial Tourism Office, the Legal Bureau of the Regional Secretariat of Bali Province, the Secretariat of the Regional People's Representative Council of the Province of Bali, and Bali Tourism Promotion Agency. To comprehend the research analysis, a face-to-face (offline) focus group discussion (FGD) was organized by re-inviting the interviewees and other relevant stakeholders, which took place in Badung, Bali, on September 11, 2022.

Some previous studies have inquired about the topic discussed in the present paper. Wu et.al (2021) evaluated the sustainability commitment program implemented by the Barcelona Provincial Government in Spain by using the method of participatory systems mapping (PSM) in a participatory complexity approach to tourism policy evaluation.<sup>9</sup> Guo et.al (2019) scrutinized sustainable tourism policy research by using the analytical framework of a systematic review.<sup>10</sup> Collins-Kreiner and Ram (2021) compared measures adopted by seven countries, representing four different continents, in responding Covid-19 Pandemic. The study suggested that those countries have not formalized comprehensive exit strategies and rehabilitation plans for the tourism sector and tend to rely on short-term local solutions.<sup>11</sup>

## **2. RESULT AND ANALYSIS**

### **2.1 The Incorporation of the Concept of Quality and Sustainable Tourism into the Tourism Master Plan of the Bali Province 2015-2029**

#### **2.1.1 The Concept of Quality and Sustainable Tourism**

Tourism is one of the essential aspects of economic development. This sector is expected to support the rate of equitable economic development such as foreign exchange earnings, equitable distribution of people's economic income, expand employment opportunities, and community entrepreneurial opportunities, as well as increase regional income, in order to participate in efforts to alleviate poverty (pro-poor tourism).<sup>12</sup> As a sector that has a multidimensional nature, it is indispensable to plan for tourism development by considering all possibilities in the future with the facts that occur in the world of tourism these days, then able to find out what efforts need to be made to achieve the goal in the future.<sup>13</sup> Multidimensional tourism certainly affects various life domains, whether directly or

---

<sup>9</sup> Jenny Suno Wu, *op. cit.*, 2.

<sup>10</sup> Yi Guo, *op.cit.*, 2.

<sup>11</sup> Noga Collins-Kreiner, *op.cit.*, 2-3.

<sup>12</sup> Aliansyah, Helmi, and Wawan Hermawan, "Peran Sektor Pariwisata pada Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Kabupaten/Kota di Jawa Barat," *Bina Ekonomi* 23, no. 1 (2019): 40.

<sup>13</sup> *Ibid.*

indirectly.<sup>14</sup> Tourism is also a tremendous and effective sector that can create job opportunities, generate foreign exchange earnings, and increase investment.<sup>15</sup>

The concept of sustainable tourism development continuously reiterates among tourism stakeholders worldwide. The idea is inspired by the concept of sustainable development, which derives from economics as a discipline but is then understood as a notion that emphasizes relationships among the environmental, economic, and social aspects.<sup>16</sup> These three aspects must be integrated systematically into decision-making across generations (present and future).<sup>17</sup> The legitimacy of 'sustainable tourism' is increasing when global actors, such as World Commission on Environment and Development (WCED), play a role in spreading its relevance to various parts of the world.<sup>18</sup>

Sustainable tourism development is carried out with reference to the United Nations World Tourism Organization's Global Code of Ethics for Tourism which outlines the principles of tourism development and serves as a guide in realizing responsible and sustainable tourism. In this context, being responsible contains the value that tourism is fully responsible for all the impacts it causes, starting from the environmental, social, cultural, and economic aspects of the present and the future.<sup>19</sup> The advent of the notion of sustainable development marked a convergence of economic development with environmentalism. This confluence was publicly demonstrated at the Stockholm Conference on Humans and the Environment in 1972, the first of a series of important UN conferences on global environmental issues. The conference supported the concept of eco-development, in which cultural, social, and environmental goals were combined with development.<sup>20</sup>

The term "quality tourism" was introduced in the model of tourism planning and development proposed by Middleton and Hawkins in 1998. They categorize tourism experiences as the result of the relationship between demand and supply. In consequence, quality tourism experiences can be obtained if visitors, tourism developers, products, media, and the local community collaborate to solve the complexities of 'quality' concepts,

---

<sup>14</sup> Ni Made Sri Nopiyan and I Made Andi Wirawan, "The Impact of Tourism on the Quality of Life of Communities in Tourist Destination Areas: A Systematic Review," *Open Access Macedonian Journal of Medical Sciences*, 9(F) (2021): 129.

<sup>15</sup> Tien Pham and Anda Nugroho, "Tourism-induced Poverty Impacts of COVID-19 in Indonesia," *Annals of Tourism Research Empirical Insights* 3, no. 2 (2022): 3.

<sup>16</sup> Justice Mensah, "Sustainable development: Meaning, History, Principles, Pillars, and Implications for Human Action: Literature Review," *Cogent Social Sciences* 5, no.1 (2019): 6-8.

<sup>17</sup> *Ibid.*, 14.

<sup>18</sup> See I Gusti Ayu Ketut Rachmi Handayani, "Green Development Rights for Optimizing Urban Area and Coastal Areas in Indonesia (Consistency of the State of the Doctrine of the Right to Control the State)," *Constitutional Review* 2, no.1 (2016): 59.

<sup>19</sup> Global Code of Ethics for Tourism, Art. 3.

<sup>20</sup> Anne Hardy, Robert J.S. Beeton, and Leonie Parson, "Sustainable Tourism: An Overview of the Concept and its Position in Relation to Conceptualisations of Tourism," *Journal of Sustainable Tourism* 10, no.6 (2002): 476.

which can be described in terms of attractions and activities, social components, and support service components (amenity).<sup>21</sup>

Moreover, the concept of quality and sustainable tourism has been recognized and adopted by many tourism planning models. The one adapted by Bali's Tourism Master Plan will be explained below.

### 2.1.2 The Content of the Master Plan

Law No. 10 of 2009 concerning Tourism (Tourism Law) determines that tourism development in Indonesia is conducted based on a tourism development master plan at the national, provincial, and regency/city levels.<sup>22</sup> Government Regulation No. 50 of 2011 concerning the National Tourism Development Master Plan 2010-2025 determines that the National Tourism Development Master Plan becomes a guideline for the preparation of the Tourism Development Master Plan at the provincial level.<sup>23</sup> Moreover, this provincial master plan serves as a reference for the master plan at the regency/city levels.<sup>24</sup>

The Minister of Tourism further adopted a regulation that provides guidelines for preparing provincial and regency/city tourism development master plans. This guideline was prepared in order to provide a reference for provincial and regency/city governments to develop sustainable tourism planning, as well as to synergize the preparation of the regional tourism master plan.<sup>25</sup>

Bali, as one of the world's tourist destinations, has a vision of regional tourism development vision that has been clearly described in the provisions of Bali's Tourism Master Plan. The vision holds that the realization of quality and sustainable cultural tourism as well as having competitiveness based on *Tri Hita Karana*<sup>26</sup> which is able to encourage regional development and people's welfare.<sup>27</sup>

The concept of quality tourism and sustainable tourism appears in the explanation of Article 11 (a). 'Quality tourism; is explained as "tourism that provides high economic benefits with minimal negative environmental and social impacts" while, 'sustainable tourism; means tourism that is not only

---

<sup>21</sup> A. Nilnoppakun and K Ampavat, "Integrating Cultural and Nostalgia Tourism to Initiate a Quality Tourism Experiences at Chiangkan, Leuy Province, Thailand," *Procedia Economics and Finance* 23 (2015): 764.

<sup>22</sup> Law No. 10 of 2009 concerning Tourism, Art. 8 (1).

<sup>23</sup> Government Regulation No. 50 of 2011 concerning the National Tourism Development Master Plan 2010-2025, Art. 4 (2).

<sup>24</sup> *Ibid.*, Art. 4 (3).

<sup>25</sup> Regulation of Tourism Minister No. 10 of 2016 concerning Guidelines for Preparation of Provincial and Regency/City Tourism Development Master Plans, Annex, Part A.

<sup>26</sup> Tri Hita Karana means the three harmonious relationships between the individual and their God, between the individual and other individuals, and between the individual and the environment. See Made Suksma Prijandhini Devi Salain, David Isles, and I Gusti Ngurah Wairocana, "Regulating Indigenous Culture as a Tourism Economic Resource," *Udayana Journal of Law and Culture* 1, no. 2 (2017): 113.

<sup>27</sup> Regional Regulation of the Province of Bali No. 10 of 2015 concerning the Regional Tourism Development Master Plan for the Province of Bali (Bali's Tourism Master Plan), Art. 7.

concerned with the current generation but also takes into account the interests of future generations.

Bali's Tourism Master Plan determines the purpose of tourism development are:

- a. increasing the quality and quantity of tourism destinations as well as the diversity of tourism attractions based on local potential;
- b. carry out marketing activities using various media effectively, efficiently, and responsibly;
- c. realizing a tourism industry capable of driving the regional economy; and
- d. develop tourism institutions and governance that can synergize destination development, marketing, and the tourism industry in a professional, effective and efficient manner.<sup>28</sup>

It also stipulates that tourism development targets are increasing the number of visits by domestic and foreign tourists; the tourists' length of stay; the amount of tourists' spending; and the community participation in tourism through tourism village development.<sup>29</sup> Therefore, Bali's Tourism Master Plan boldly demonstrates the quality and sustainable tourism as the vision, which also indicates that the quantity targets have been reached, through its purpose and targets.

### **2.1.3 Normative Issues in the Master Plan: A Contradiction**

As discussed in Section 2.1.2, the concept of quality and sustainable tourism has been incorporated into Bali's Tourism Master Plan. However, inconsistencies and contradictions exist in the visions, targets, and objectives to be achieved. On the one hand, tourism development in Bali refers to the quality and sustainable tourism, but on the other hand, it also focuses on quantity tourism.

Such inconsistency can be seen in Article 8 (b) of Bali's Tourism Master Plan, which stipulates that to increase the number of domestic and international visitors, building a synergistic, superior, and responsible tourism marketing strategy is part of the goals of regional tourism development. It is further emphasized in Article 10 (1) (a), which stipulates that increasing the number of domestic and international visitors is one of the objectives of regional tourism development. Referring to the marketing strategy as stipulated in Article 8 (b), Article 46 (e) determines that working with airlines to sell holiday packages at discounted travel ticket prices for both domestic and international tourists during the off-season is a part of creating promotional activities. Referring to those provisions, Bali tourism development tends to receive more tourist visits.

The master plan also indirectly illustrates that tourism activities in Bali are divided into two seasons, namely the high season and the low season, which ultimately results in uneven tourist arrivals throughout the year. In the high season, tourist destinations can be overwhelmed by tourist activity during a certain period, while it is also possible that there is no

---

<sup>28</sup> *Ibid.*, Art. 8.

<sup>29</sup> *Ibid.*, Art.10.

tourist activity at all in another period in the same year, which is known as the low season.<sup>30</sup> The concept of quality and sustainable tourism as the vision of tourism development in Bali's Tourism Master Plan is certainly becoming increasingly opposed to the existence of several provisions of the article that tend to lead to tourism based on quantity rather than based on quality and sustainability.

The master plan also indirectly illustrates that tourism activities in Bali are divided into two seasons: the high season and the low season. It ultimately results in uneven tourist arrivals throughout the year. In the high season, tourist destinations can be overwhelmed by tourist activity during a specific period, while less activity in another period in the same year, known as the low season.<sup>31</sup> The concept of quality and sustainable tourism as the vision of tourism development in Bali's Tourism Master Plan is undoubtedly becoming increasingly opposed to the existence of several provisions of the article that tend to lead to tourism based on quantity rather than quality and sustainability.

Tourism which is considered one of the sectors that can encourage economic growth, especially in increasing the country's foreign exchange earnings, in the end, led to tourism policies that tend to be more directed at the number of tourist visits than the quality of tourism.<sup>32</sup> The wrong mindset assumes that the benchmark for the success of tourism development is formulated from the number of tourist visits and the estimated amount of foreign exchange the State receives. The number of tourists is pursued as much as possible, and most of the natural and cultural resources are commercialized without considering the ability, balance, readiness, and resilience of local communities against various accompanying effects such as environmental damage and socio-cultural disfunction.<sup>33</sup>

The next problem relates to the meaning of quality in the phrase "quality and sustainable tourism" in this case, what is meant or expected to be quality is still vague, whether human quality, the quality of tourist destinations, or the quality of the tourists. The meaning of 'quality' needs to be defined clearly so that future tourism development strategy planning can be well-directed and fulfill the expected target.

Bali Tourism Promotion Agency's Deputy Policy Maker admitted that there is a conceptual issue in Bali's Tourism Master Plan. Several terms may distort the generally accepted meaning of sustainable tourism. For example, the term "sustainable", "environmentally sound", and "quality", is

---

<sup>30</sup> Addin Maulana and Chamma Fitri Putri Pradjwalita Koesfardani, "Pola Musiman Kunjungan Wisatawan Mancanegara Ke Bali," *Jurnal Kepariwisata Indonesia: Jurnal Penelitian dan Pengembangan Kepariwisata Indonesia* 14, no.2 (2020): 75.

<sup>31</sup> Addin Maulana and Chamma Fitri Putri Pradjwalita Koesfardani, "Pola Musiman Kunjungan Wisatawan Mancanegara Ke Bali," *Jurnal Kepariwisata Indonesia: Jurnal Penelitian dan Pengembangan Kepariwisata Indonesia* 14, no.2 (2020): 75.

<sup>32</sup> Anak Agung Duwira Hadi Santosa and Luh Ayu Nadira Saraswati, "Pariwisata Kerta Masa: Gagasan Alternatif Kebijakan Pembangunan Pariwisata Bali," *Jurnal Magister Hukum Udayana* 9, no. 4 (2020): 72.

<sup>33</sup> Yulianto Bambang Setyadi, "Pariwisata dan Perubahan Nilai-Nilai Sosial Budaya Berdasarkan Lingkungan Tradisi pada Masyarakat Bali," *Jurnal Penelitian Humaniora* 8, no. 2 (2007): 103.

formulated with different meanings in the master plan compared to the concepts accepted in other regions or countries. Inconsistent use of phrases resulted in differences in perspectives. It also biases tourism development, whether referring to quality and sustainable tourism or focusing on the number of tourists.<sup>34</sup>

## **2.2 The Evaluation of Implementation of Bali's Tourism Master Plan during the Covid-19 Pandemic**

### **2.2.1 Covid-19 and its Catastrophic Impact on Tourism Industry in Bali**

Bali's tourism industry is one of the sectors that has been badly affected by Covid-19. Undeniably, the tourism industry is the primary source of Bali's local revenue. For decades, the tourism industry positively impacts Bali's economic growth. However, the negative impact certainly cannot be ignored. In the last few decades, Bali has relied heavily on the tourism industry without being accompanied by the strengthening and development of other sectors, such as the agriculture, maritime, fisheries, and plantation sectors, to support its local income.

During the Covid-19 Pandemic, various countries' governments issued several policies of close borders, restrictions, and isolation to prevent the spread of Covid-19. Those policies have paralyzed the tourism sector from 2020 to 2021. Covid-19 has decreased the number of tourist visits to Bali. Most tourism companies were closed and did not earn any income, which created unemployment.<sup>35</sup> Even some companies with more capital still operated during the mobility restrictions, and their sales dropped significantly.

It is estimated that the losses caused by the pandemic to Bali tourism reached IDR 9,7 trillion every month, which of course, had a domino effect on other sectors in Bali.<sup>36</sup> During the mobility restrictions, the demand for accommodation and food and beverages (F & B) sectors in the second quarter of 2020 are closely related to the decline in tourism activities in Bali during the Covid-19 situation. This situation has impacted Bali's economic growth ratio during Covid-19.

Central Bureau of Statistics of Bali Province in November 2022 released the Covid-19 impact on the growth of the Bali Province Gross Regional Domestic Product (GRDP) from 2020 to 2022, as can be described in Table 1.

---

<sup>34</sup> I Nyoman Sunarta, "Implementation of the Bali's Tourism Master Plan," Interview by Anak Agung Gede Duwira Hadi Santosa, Denpasar, August 18<sup>th</sup>, 2022. Regarding the generally-accepted concept of sustainable tourism, see Putri Triari, Kali Jones, and Ni Gusti Ayu Dyah Satyawati, "Indigenous People, Economic Development and Sustainable Tourism: A Comparative Analysis between Bali, Indonesia and Australia," *Udayana Journal of Law and Culture* 1, no. 1 (2017): 16-18.

<sup>35</sup> Nyoman Dwika Ayu Amrita, Made Mulia Handayani, and Luh Erynayati, "Pengaruh Pandemi Covid-19 Terhadap Pariwisata Bali," *Jurnal Manajemen dan Bisnis Equilibrium* 7, no. 2 (2021): 249.

<sup>36</sup> Kompas, "Dampak Pandemi Covid-19, Pariwisata Bali Rugi Rp 9,7 Triliun Tiap Bulan," <https://regional.kompas.com/read/2020/05/13/17591091/dampak-pandemi-Covid-19-pariwisata-bali-rugi-rp-97-triliun-tiap-bulan>.

**Table 1. Bali Province Gross Regional Domestic Product (GRDP)'s Growth in 2020 to 2022 (Q to Q)<sup>37</sup>**

<b>Period (Quartal)</b>	<b>Percentage (%)</b>
First Quartal of 2020	-7.68
Second Quartal of 2020	-7.26
Third Quartal of 2020	1.60
Fourth Quartal of 2020	0.95
First Quartal of 2021	-5.17
Second Quartal of 2021	5.72
Third Quartal of 2021	-4.09
Fourth Quartal of 2021	4.52
First Quartal of 2022	-4.30
Second Quartal of 2022	7.42
Third Quartal of 2022	0.60

According to Table 1, there has been a drastic decline from 2020 to 2021. Contractionary growth did not stop in the first quarter of 2020 but continued in the following quarters. In the second quarter of 2021, an economic increase occurred due to the easing of the policy limiting community activities. Unfortunately, in the third quarter of 2021, the Covid-19 suspects increased daily as the restriction policy was implemented into force. This situation confirms that the impact of Covid-19 has caused a decline in the activity of the tourism industry, which is the 'backbone' of Bali Province's economy.

Governments have taken travel restrictions and lockdown policies adopted by many countries over the world to prevent the Covid-19 spreading. This policy impacted the decreased number of foreign tourists visiting Indonesia, especially Bali, after I Gusti Ngurah Rai international airport was closed for international and domestic flights. The following tables show data on the Development of International and Domestic Air Transport for the Province of Bali from January 2020 to May 2022 based on data obtained from the Central Bureau of Statistics of Bali Province for 2020, 2021, and 2022, as follows.

**Table 2. International and Domestic Air Transportation Development in Bali Province in 2020 - 2022 (Y to Y)<sup>38</sup>**

<b>Year</b>	<b>International (Person)</b>	<b>Domestic (Person)</b>
2020	1,354,443	1,777,301
2021	7	318,557
2022 (May)	109,750	395,645

The data above shows how, after Covid-19 spread, the tourism industry in Bali drastically declined to minus 82% (eighty-two percent) of visits in 2019. Covid-19 has hit the world and Bali's tourism sector hard,

<sup>37</sup> Central Bureau of Statistics of Bali Province, Statistical Official News No. 67/11/51/Th. XVI, 2022.

<sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*

where 80% (eighty percent) of Bali's local revenue comes from the tourism industry. The number of tourism visits which dropped drastically during Covid-19 impacted the country's foreign exchange earnings from the tourism sector, which also significantly decreased.

A decline of up to 90% (ninety percent) in the arrival of foreign tourists in 2021 occurred due to the suspension of commercial flights at I Gusti Ngurah Rai Airport and Tanjung Benoa Port for almost the entire period of the second until the fourth quarter of 2020 cannot be ruled out. Furthermore, this slump can be seen from the average lowercase of star hotels, which in mid-2020 only left about 3% (three percent).<sup>39</sup>

The decline in tourist visits and the Covid-19 impact has caused many tourism businesses to close temporarily. Most of them are permanently closed, leading to employees not receiving a salary for almost a year. It triggered a rising wave of unemployment in Bali.

Based on data from the Central Bureau of Statistics of Bali Province comparing the unemployment rate in 2019 (pre-Covid-19) to 2020 (during Covid-19) as follows.

**Table 3. Bali Province Unemployment Data in 2019-2020<sup>40</sup>**

Regency/City	Unemployment Data			
	2019 (person) / Pre-Covid-19	2020 (person)	2021 (person)	2022 (Person)
Jembrana	2,102	7,485	7,354	7,074
Tabanan	3,527	11,663	10,939	11,000
Badung	1,543	27,324	28,027	28,650
Gianyar	4,506	22,028	20,064	22,921
Klungkung	1,679	5,794	5,577	2,262
Bangli	1,104	2,727	2,659	1,146
Karangasem	1,590	6,284	6,099	8,629
Buleleng	10,960	19,861	20,234	20,358
Denpasar	12,277	41,334	37,716	29,429
Bali Province (Total)	39,288	144,500	138,669	131,469

Covid-19 has a different impact on each regency/city in Bali. For example, for the Badung Regency, Gianyar Regency, and Denpasar City, the impact of Covid-19 was most felt because most tourism activities were in those areas. The local income of each city/regency from the tourism industry had significantly decreased. Badung Regency relies heavily on the tourism sector, but Covid-19 has made Badung's economy impoverished. The number of unemployed in Badung Regency increased by 1,670.84 percent during 2020 compared to the previous year's position of 27,324 people, and conditions continued to increase until 2022 reaching 28,650

<sup>39</sup> Balipost, "Ketahanan Perekonomian Bali," <https://www.balipost.com/news/2020/06/11/128784/Ketahanan-Perekonomian-Bali.html>.

<sup>40</sup> Central Bureau of Statistics of Bali Province, *op.cit.*

unemployed people. According to the abovementioned data, this realization makes Badung the number two area in Bali with enormous unemployment.

Denpasar City occupied the first position with a total of 41,334 unemployed people, an increase of 236.69 percent year of year. It should be noted that Denpasar City has been trending for the past three years to become the area with the most significant number of unemployed in Bali. The opposite condition occurred in Badung Regency, which in 2019 ranked number two with the lowest unemployment out of nine Bali regions (1,543 persons).

### **2.2.2 Lack of Implementation and the Need to Offer an Adjustment**

Bali's Tourism Master Plan, along with quality and sustainable tourism contained in it, has not been implemented as expected due to Covid-19. Whatsoever, the government officers argued that they have been trying and implementing the master plan as optimally as possible.<sup>41</sup> During the covid-19, the government has been focusing on formulating policies for handling Covid-19 in a force majeure situation. The current focus of the policy is the recovery of the post-Covid-19 tourism industry, which will begin to revive.<sup>42</sup> Even though the master plan faced some difficulties during the covid-19, it is too early to assess that it was not implemented correctly. The master plan is still relevant to be implemented until 2029 and may still be used as guidelines by the government and other related parties to develop the Bali tourism industry.<sup>43</sup>

The forms and models of tourism policies are the results of tourism policy products that serve as directions and guidelines for taking tourism development actions. The concept of sustainable tourism development that integrates aspects of development and the environment is one strategy that can be used to control negative impacts and maximize the positive impacts of tourism. In this case, tourism industry policies may become the frontline in realizing people's welfare and sustainable development that can ensure that the needs of the present generation are met without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their needs.

Tourism industry policies that underlie every dynamic movement and development have shaped the achievements of tourism development so far. Tourism industry policies have functions to organize, regulate, and direct these forms of behavior under the directions and objectives of tourism development. The policy aimed to ensure that the action and behavior of tourism actors are in line with the tourism policy. The tourism industry is expected to improve the community's welfare while maintaining and sustaining various tourism resources. The evaluation of the policy implementation is becoming a crucial step to examine whether the policy can be implemented as expected. Covid-19 seems to be the right moment to evaluate the shortcomings contained in Bali's Tourism Master Plan.

---

<sup>41</sup> Ni Nyoman Ayu Andriani, "Implementation of the Bali's Tourism Master Plan," Interview by Anak Agung Gede Duwira Hadi Santosa, Denpasar, August 18<sup>th</sup>, 2022.

<sup>42</sup> Ngurah Satria Wardana, "Implementation of the Bali's Tourism Master Plan," Interview by Anak Agung Gede Duwira Hadi Santosa, Denpasar, August 18<sup>th</sup>, 2022.

<sup>43</sup> I Gusti Agung Wikrama, "Implementation of the Bali's Tourism Master Plan," Interview by Anak Agung Gede Duwira Hadi Santosa, Denpasar, August 18<sup>th</sup>, 2022.

In essence, policy evaluation is a series of assessment activities closely related to the policy's substance, implementation, and influence. Stewart and Lester argued that policy evaluation is conducted to discover two things. First, to estimate the potential consequences regarding the implementation of the policy by describing its effects. Second, to measure the failure or success of the policy based on previously established criteria.<sup>44</sup> In this regard, the policy recovery scheme may have relevance.<sup>45</sup> This scheme, among others, offers a reconstruction of the policy system of tourism for capturing the whole aspect of tourism and the adoption of the contextual approach that would lead to the maintenance of the sustainability of tourism.<sup>46</sup>

Based on the abovementioned, several matters shall be adjusted in Bali's Tourism Master Plan. The purpose of any adjustments is to measure how these policies can improve environmental, economic, social, and cultural problems; to review the meaning and consistency used of the concept of quality and sustainable tourism; to assess the consequences that arise from the implementation of the policy. Therefore, this paper proposes an adjustment on 4 (four) aspects: availability and capacity of the environment, restrictions on tourists' physical contact with vulnerable cultural heritage sites, local communities' ownership and their involvement in tourism management decision-making, and clarifying the rights and obligations of cultural heritage bearers:

First, Bali's Tourism Master Plan for the future must regulate more strictly regarding the availability and capacity of the environment used as a tourism industry area. It should reflect and implement the concept of sustainable environment.

Second, restrictions on tourists' physical contact with vulnerable cultural heritage sites need to be adopted in Bali's Tourism Master Plan in the future in order to protect cultural heritage sites protected by the Central or Regional Government as a form of sustainable cultural heritage preservation. Such a restriction needs to be made on tourism activities in the area of ancient cultural heritage sites, which have the potential to degrade the cultural values contained therein and damage these cultural heritage sites. This is in line with Regulation of the Province of Bali No. 4 of 2014 on the Preservation of Balinese Cultural Heritage.<sup>47</sup>

Third, the participation of the local community in every activity of the tourism industry must be prioritized to reduce domination by other tourism stakeholders in organizing tourism in a particular place. Therefore, Bali's Tourism Master Plan in the future needs to consider sociological aspects by further strengthening the position of the local community as a determinant

---

<sup>44</sup> Chazali H Situmorang. *Kebijakan Publik: Teori Analisis, Implementasi Dan Evaluasi Kebijakan* (Depok: Social Security Development Institute, 2016), 282.

<sup>45</sup> Ida Bagus Wyasa Putra, "The Contextual Problem in the Development of Indonesian International Tourism Law," *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research 282-Proceedings of the International Conference on Business Law and Local Wisdom in Tourism* (2018): 155-156.

<sup>46</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>47</sup> Regulation of the Province of Bali No. 4 of 2014 on the Preservation of Balinese Cultural Heritage, Consideration (a).

of the direction of tourism development and management by respecting the existing local wisdom.

Forth, in implementing the concept of sustainable tourism, the Bali Tourism Master Plan needs to clarify the rights and obligations of the people who preserve cultural heritage and their environment as tourist areas. This is in line with the provisions contained in Regulation of the Province of Bali No. 5 of 2020 concerning Standards for Implementing Balinese Cultural Tourism.<sup>48</sup>

### 3. CONCLUSION

The concept of quality and sustainable tourism has been incorporated into the Bali Tourism Master Plan. It is pretty apparent that there is a contradiction between the vision and the goals and objectives of the master plan. On the one hand, the vision of the Master Plan is to achieve quality and sustainable tourism. However, on the other hand, the targeted goals and objectives led to the number of tourist visits to Bali. Based on a qualitative evaluation, the issue of contradiction regarding the substance of the master plan document also has an impact on its implementation. Further, the Covid-19 pandemic indicated that the plan could not be appropriately implemented. In reality, the concept of quality and sustainable tourism cannot be applied because the main target of the policy is quantity tourism. Therefore, the revision of the master plan is urgent in order to achieve quality and sustainable Bali tourism.

### Acknowledgment

This article is developed based on the results of research funded by the Research and Community Service Institute of Udayana University under Udayana Excellence Research (*Penelitian Unggulan Udayana*) scheme in 2022.

### BIBLIOGRAPHY

#### Book

Chazali H Situmorang. *Kebijakan Publik: Teori Analisis, Implementasi Dan Evaluasi Kebijakan*. Depok: Social Security Development Institute, 2016.

#### Journal Article

Aliansyah, Helmi, and Wawan Hermawan. "Peran Sektor Pariwisata pada Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Kabupaten/Kota di Jawa Barat." *Bina Ekonomi* 23, no. 1 (2019): 39-55.

<https://doi.org/10.26593/be.v23i1.4654.39-55>

Amrita, Nyoman Dwika Ayu, Made Mulia Handayani, and Luh Erynayati. "Pengaruh Pandemi Covid-19 Terhadap Pariwisata Bali." *Jurnal Manajemen dan Bisnis Equilibrium* 7, no. 2 (2021): 246-257.

[https://doi.org/10.47329/jurnal\\_mbe.v7i2.824](https://doi.org/10.47329/jurnal_mbe.v7i2.824)

---

<sup>48</sup> Regulation of the Province of Bali No. 5 of 2020 concerning Standards for Implementing Balinese Cultural Tourism, Art. 32.

- Cahigas, Maela Madel L. et.al. "Factors Affecting Visiting Behavior to Bali during the COVID-19 Pandemic: An Extended Theory of Planned Behavior Approach." *Sustainability* 14 (2022): 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su141610424>
- Guo, Yi, Jinbo Jiang, and Shengchao Li. "A Sustainable Tourism Policy Research Review." *Sustainability* 11, no. 11 (2019): 1-16. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su11113187>
- Handayani, I Gusti Ayu Ketut Rachmi. "Green Development Rights for Optimizing Urban Area and Coastal Areas in Indonesia (Consistency of the State of the Doctrine of the Right to Control the State)." *Constitutional Review* 2, no. 1 (2016): 57-76. <https://doi.org/10.31078/consrev213>
- Hardy, Anne, Robert J.S. Beeton and Leonie Parson. "Sustainable Tourism: An Overview of the Concept and its Position in Relation to Conceptualisations of Tourism." *Journal of Sustainable Tourism* 10, no. 6 (2002): 475-496. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09669580208667183>
- Maulana, Addin and Chamma Fitri Putri Pradjwalita Koesfardani. "Pola Musiman Kunjungan Wisatawan Mancanegara ke Bali." *Jurnal Kepariwisata Indonesia: Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pengembangan Kepariwisata Indonesia* 14, no. 2 (2020): 73-90. <https://doi.org/10.47608/jki.v14i22020.73-90>
- Mensah, Justice. "Sustainable development: Meaning, History, Principles, Pillars, and Implications for Human Action: Literature review." *Cogent Social Sciences* 5, no. 1 (2019): 1-21. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2019.1653531>
- Nilnoppakun, A. and K. Ampavat. "Integrating Cultural and Nostalgia Tourism to Initiate a Quality Tourism Experiences at Chiangkan, Leuy Province, Thailand." *Procedia Economics and Finance* 23 (2015): 763-771. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S2212-5671\(15\)00545-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2212-5671(15)00545-6)
- Noga Collins-Kreiner and Yael Ram. "National Tourism Strategies during the Covid-19 Pandemic." *Annals of Tourism Research* 89 (2021): 1-6. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2020.103076>
- Nopiyani, Ni Made Sri and Wirawan, I. M. A. "The Impact of Tourism on the Quality of Life of Communities in Tourist Destination Areas: A Systematic Review." *Open Access Macedonian Journal of Medical Sciences* 9 (2021): 129-136. <https://doi.org/10.3889/oamjms.2021.5966>
- Okafor, Luka, Usman Khalid, Sasidaran Gopalan. "COVID-19 Economic Policy Response, Resilience and Tourism Recovery." *Annals of Tourism Research Empirical Insights* 3, no. 2 (2022): 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annale.2022.100073>
- Pham, Tien and Anda Nugroho. "Tourism-induced Poverty Impacts of COVID-19 in Indonesia." *Annals of Tourism Research Empirical Insights*, 3, no. 2 (2022): 1-12. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annale.2022.100069>
- Putra, Ida Bagus Wyasa. "The Contextual Problem in the Development of Indonesian International Tourism Law." *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research 282-Proceedings of the International Conference on Business Law and Local Wisdom in Tourism* (2018): 155-156. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icblt-18.2018.37>

- Santosa, Anak Agung Duwira Hadi and Luh Ayu Nadira Saraswati. "Pariwisata Kerta Masa: Gagasan Alternatif Kebijakan Pembangunan Pariwisata Bali." *Jurnal Magister Hukum Udayana* 9, no.4 (2020): 723-738. <https://doi.org/10.24843/JMHU.2020.v09.i04.p05>
- Salain, Made Suksma Prijandhini Devi, David Isles, and I Gusti Ngurah Wairocana. "Regulating Indigenous Culture as a Tourism Economic Resource." *Udayana Journal of Law and Culture* 1, no. 2 (2017): 121-140 <https://doi.org/10.24843/UJLC.2017.v01.i02.p03>
- Setyadi, Yulianto Bambang. "Pariwisata dan Perubahan Nilai-Nilai Sosial Budaya Berdasarkan Lingkungan Tradisi pada Masyarakat Bali." *Jurnal Penelitian Humaniora* 8, no. 2 (2007): 97-109. <http://hdl.handle.net/11617/580>
- Triari, Putri, Kali Jones, and Ni Gusti Ayu Dyah Satyawati. "Indigenous People, Economic Development and Sustainable Tourism: A Comparative Analysis between Bali, Indonesia and Australia." *Udayana Journal of Law and Culture* 1, no. 1 (2017): 16-30. <https://doi.org/10.24843/UJLC.2017.v01.i01.p02>
- Wong, Jose Weng Chou and Ivan Ka Wai Lai. "The Mechanism Influencing the Residents' Support of the Government Policy for Accelerating Tourism Recovery under COVID-19." *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management* 52 (2022): 219-227. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhtm.2022.06.018>
- Wu, Jenny Suno, Pete Barbrook-Johnson, and Xavier Font. "Participatory Complexity in Tourism Policy: Understanding Sustainability Programmes with Participatory Systems Mapping." *Annals of Tourism Research* 90 (2021):1-13. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2021.103269>

### **Legal Document**

- United Nations World Tourism Organization. Global Code of Ethics for Tourism
- Indonesia. Law No. 10 of 2009 concerning Tourism.
- Indonesia. Government Regulation No. 50 of 2011 concerning the National Tourism Development Master Plan 2010-2025.
- Indonesia. Regulation of Tourism Minister No. 10 of 2016 concerning Guidelines for Preparation of Provincial and Regency/City Tourism Development Master Plans.
- Bali Province. Regulation of the Province of Bali No. 4 of 2014 on the Preservation of Balinese Cultural Heritage.
- Bali Province. Regulation of the Province of Bali No. 10 of 2015 concerning the Regional Tourism Development Master Plan for the Province of Bali.
- Bali Province. Regulation of the Province of Bali No. 5 of 2020 concerning Standards for Implementing Balinese Cultural Tourism

### **Other Document**

Central Bureau of Statistics of Bali Province, Statistical Official News No. 67/11/51/Th. XVI, 2022.

Sun, Ya-Yen et.al, “*Road to Recovery: Assessing Job Risk and the Impact on the Most Vulnerable in Indonesia’s Pandemic-Hit Tourism Industry*”, Research Report, the Australia-Indonesia Centre, 2021.

### **Interview**

Wikrama, I Gusti Agung. “Implementation of the Bali’s Tourism Master Plan,” Interview by Anak Agung Gede Duwira Hadi Santosa, Denpasar, August 18, 2022.

Sunarta, I Nyoman. “Implementation of the Bali’s Tourism Master Plan,” Interview by Anak Agung Gede Duwira Hadi Santosa, Denpasar, August 18, 2022.

Wardana, Ngurah Satria. “Implementation of the Bali’s Tourism Master Plan,” Interview by Anak Agung Gede Duwira Hadi Santosa, Denpasar, August 18, 2022.

Ayu Andriani, Ni Nyoman. “Implementation of the Bali’s Tourism Master Plan,” Interview by Anak Agung Gede Duwira Hadi Santosa, Denpasar, August 18, 2022.

### **Website Content**

Balipost, “Ketahanan Perekonomian Bali”  
<https://www.balipost.com/news/2020/06/11/128784/Ketahanan-Perekonomian-Bali.html>

Kompas, “Dampak Pandemi Covid-19, Pariwisata Bali Rugi Rp 9,7 Triliun Tiap Bulan”  
<https://regional.kompas.com/read/2020/05/13/17591091/dampak-pandemi-covid-19-pariwisata-bali-rugi-rp-97-triliun-tiap-bulan>