

SHIFTS IN INDONESIAN-FRENCH POEM TRANSLATION

Ni Made Ayu Widiastuti, Putu Weddha Savitri

English Department, Faculty of Arts, Udayana University

ayufsb@gmail.com, weddha_savitri@unud.ac.id

Abstract

This paper aims at analyzing the translation shifts of a poem containing figurative expressions from Indonesian into French and describing the translation principles occur in the shifts. The data in this paper is an Indonesian poem with the title “Gestural Tubuh Perempuan” and its translation in French. This is a library research with qualitative-descriptive method. The analyses were conducted by applying translation shifts theory by Catford in Venuti (2000) and translation principles by Nida (1975). The findings show that there are many shifts occur in the target language. The shifts that frequently occur are in the intra-system of the language. There is only a few loss and skewing of information in the shifts, but a lot of addition of information especially for the use of French articles.

Keywords: poem, figurative expressions, translation shifts, translation principles

I INTRODUCTION

Literary work is the expression of feelings and ideas written in stylistic form. One of the examples of literary work is a poem. A poem is defined as a piece of writing in which the expression of feelings and ideas is given intensity by particular attention to diction (sometimes involving rhyme), rhythm, and imagery (Oxford Dictionary, 2000). In order to understand a poem in other language, it needs to be translated. In translating a poem, translators try to retain the rhythm, length, and the most important one is retaining the messages. Sometimes there are several changes of forms and linguistic adjustments in translating a poem.

Translations of literary and non-literary works are not the same in terms of the method or procedure used by translators. Newmark (1988) states that in translating a literary piece of work the most attention is paid to connotation and emotion in imaginative literature. A translator in this case has to understand both the source and target language cultures, as well as able to transfer the figurative language into the target language. In fact, there are not two languages have the same culture and language systems, then, there arises a question in regards to the translation of figurative language: is poetry translatable or untranslatable? Some translators might argue that – to some extents – poetry is untranslatable, but the others said that it is translatable.

Suryawinata in Anggana (2012) proposes linguistic, literary or aesthetic, and socio-cultural problems faced by a translator in translating literary works.

(1-1) Linguistic Problems

“Collocation and obscured (non-standard) syntactical structures are the linguistic matters. Collocation refers to words or word groups with which a word or words may typically combine. The combination may be syntagmatic or horizontal, like make a speech (not say a speech), run a meeting (not do a meeting), etc. The obscured (non-standard) syntactic structures may be intentionally written in a poem as a part of the expressive function of the text that should be rendered as closely as possible.”

(1-2) Literary or Aesthetic Problems

“Aesthetic values or poetic truth in a poem are conveyed in word order and sounds, as well as in cognitive sense (logic). They have no independent meaning, but are correlative with the various types of meaning in the text. There are three factors that make problems on literary or aesthetic: Poetic Structure, Metaphorical Expressions and Sound. The first factor is poetic structure. It is important to note that structure meant here is the plan of the poem as a whole, the shape and the balance of individual sentence or of each line. Metaphorical expressions, as the second factor, mean any constructions evoking visual, sounds, touch, and taste images, the traditional metaphors, direct comparisons without the words "like" and "as if", and all figurative languages. Intentionally, the writer does not use the term metaphor in the sub-heading since it has different meaning for some people. The last of literary or aesthetic factors is sound. As stated before, sound is anything connected with sound cultivation including rhyme, rhythm, assonance, onomatopoeia, etc.”

(1-3) Socio-Cultural Problems

“Words or expressions that contain culturally-bound word(s) create certain problems. The socio-cultural problems exist in the phrases, clauses, or sentences containing word(s) related to the four major cultural categories, namely: ideas, behavior, product, and ecology. The "ideas" includes belief, values, and institution; "behavior" includes customs or habits, "products" includes art, music, and artifacts, and "ecology" includes flora, fauna, plains, winds, and weather.”

Shift may occur in translating a poem. It might be because of the different linguistic systems, aesthetic values, and cultures in both source language and target language. Therefore, this paper is written in order to know more about the translation analysis of Indonesian-French poem. Indonesian does not have totally similar linguistic system with French, neither does the aesthetic value nor the cultures. This paper then has the aims of analyzing the translation shifts of the Indonesian poem entitled “Gestural Tubuh Perempuan” French and describing the translation principles occur in the shifts.

II MATERIALS AND METHOD

2.1 DATA SOURCE

The poem with the title *Gestural Tubuh Perempuan* written by Muda Wijaya and its translation is chosen and analyzed in this paper. It is written in

a book of poems' collection entitled *Couleur Femme* (2010). The poem is about *Kartini*, the Indonesian feminist who had struggled for women emancipation in Indonesia around 1900s. She is famous with the slogan *habis gelap terbitlah terang*" or from darkness to light. The slogan is applied in the poem that contains two sections; (1) *gelap* (dark) and (2) *terang* (light). The poem and its translation in French are as the following.

	SOURCE LANGUAGE	TARGET LANGUAGE
	Gestural Tubuh Perempuan	Les gestes du corps féminin
1	-kartini	-Kartini ³⁰
2	<i>Lorong gelap</i>	<i>Une ruelle sombre</i>
3	<i>Kereta perjamuan masuk di dalamnya.</i>	<i>La carriole aux mets ³¹ y pénètre</i>
4	gelap	sombre
5	apa itu kematian?	qu'est-ce que la mort?
6	rasakan hawa dingin	sentir l'air froid
7	berulang-ulang	encore et encore
8	bersentuhan.	nous toucher.
9	mata itu milikku juga	ces yeux m'appartiennent aussi
10	menggambar kepala dan tangga	dessinent une tête et un escalier
11	di mana isyarat ayat	où les symboles des versets
12	sunyikan belahan bulan.	dissimulent un quartier de lune.
13	terang	clair
14	sepasang mata itu milikku juga	cette paire d'yeux m'appartient aussi
15	menggambar kepala dan tangga	dessine une tête et un escalier
16	memutar kerinduan pada hasrat	tourne la nostalgie en désir
17	bergaris air	strié d'eau
18	bergurat gerimis	marqué par la bruine
19	jadi kerling pengantin	devient le clin d'œil d'une mariée
20	berumbai matahari	portant des franges de soleil
21	berkabar galang	apportant des nouvelles des poutres
22	di jalan	de la rue
23	ruang hingar dan gemetar	espace bruyant et tremblant
24	fana dan telanjang.	éphémère et nu.
25	aku mengeja jantungku sendiri	j'épèle mon propre cœur
26	membuka mata	ouvrant les yeux
27	dalam gugusan.	en grappes.
28	barangkali	peut-être
29	kelopak nasahmu mengigau	ton enveloppe humide délire
30	menarikan hasrat	fait danser le désir
31	melebur sunyi	fondre le silence
32	mereguk kekal	savoure l'éternité
33	tafsir yang dikaburkan.	les interprétations rendues dissimulées.

2.2 DATA COLLECTION

The data were collected by note taking technique. First, the source language data is read several times in order to understand the meanings and messages, then its translation in French as the target language is read and

compared to the Indonesian to find the types of shift and the translation principles occur within the shifts. The data were then underlined and analyzed.

2.3 DATA ANALYSIS

In order to analyze the shifts in the translation of Indonesian poem “Gestural Tubuh Perempuan” into French, the theory of translation shifts by Catford in Venuti (2000) is applied. Moreover, theory by Nida (1974) is applied in analyzing the translation principles.

2.3.1 TRANSLATION SHIFTS

Catford said that “shifts mean departures from formal correspondence in the process of going from the SL (Source Language) to the TL (Target Language).” There are two kinds of shifts: level shifts and category shifts.

2.3.1.1 Level Shifts

It means that a SL item at one linguistic level has a TL translation equivalent at a different level (Catford in Venuti, 2000:141).

Example: Fr. SL text: J’ai laissé mes lunettes sur la table.

Eng. TL text: I’ve left my glasses on the table. (Catford in Venuti, 2000:143)

2.3.1.2 Category Shifts

It refers to unbounded and rank-bound translation. Unbounded translation is approximately “normal” or “free” translation in which SL-TL equivalences are set up at whatever rank is appropriate. There is usually sentence-sentence equivalence, but in the course of a text, equivalences may shift up and down the rank-scale, often being established at ranks lower than the sentence. Meanwhile, the terms rank-bound translation only refer to those special cases where equivalence is deliberately limited to the ranks below the sentence, thus leading to “bad translation” (translation in which the TL text is either not a normal TL form at all, or is not relatable to the same situational substance as the SL text (Catford in Venuti, 2000: 143). Category shifts are divided into four: structure-shifts, class-shifts, unit-shifts, intra-system-shifts.

- (i) Structure-shifts usually occur in phonological and graphological translation as well as in total translation. It happens because the SL and TL have different structure element, but need to have formal correspondence.

Examples:

1. Eng. SL text: I **love** **you**
S P O
- Fr. TL text: Je **t’aime**
(Je toi aime)
S O P
2. Eng. SL text: My **black** **pen**
M Head
- Fr. TL text: Mon **stylo** **noir**
Head M

- (ii) Class shifts occur when the translation equivalent of a SL item is a member of a different class from the original item.

Examples:

1. Eng. SL text: a **white** house
M-Adj.
Fr. TL text: une maison **blanche**
Q-Adj (Catford in Venuti, 2000:145)
2. Eng. SL text: a **medical** student
M-Adj.
Fr. TL text: un étudiant **en médecine**
Adv. P (Catford in Venuti, 2000:145)

- (iii) Unit shift means changes of rank that is the departures from formal correspondence in which the translation equivalent of a unit at one rank in the SL is a unit at a different rank in the TL.

Example:

- Eng. SL text: He **swims** three times a week.
(lower rank)
Fr. TL text: Il **fait de la natation** trois fois par semaine
(higher rank) (Catford in Venuti, 2000:145)

- (iv) Intra-system shift means a departure from formal correspondence in which (a term operating in) one system in the SL has its translation equivalent (e term operating in) a different – non corresponding – system in the TL. Such shifts from one system to another are always entailed by unit shift or class shift.

Example:

Translation equivalent of English singular is French plural and vice-versa.

advice = des conseils
news = des nouvelles
trousers = le pantalon
the dishes = la vaisselle
(Catford in Venuti (2000:146)

According to Catford English and French may be said to have four articles. The formal correspondences between them are as follows.

	French	English
Zero	-	-
Definite	le, la, l', les	the
Indefinite	un, une	a, an
Partitive	du, de la, de l', des	some, any

Examples of the uses of the articles are:

Il est - professeur. He is a teacher.
Il a la jambe cassée. He has a broken leg.
L'amour Love
Du vin Wine
Catford in Venuti (2000:146-147)

From the sentence examples given by Catford, he then concluded that “it sometimes happens that the equivalent of an article is not the formally corresponding term in the system”.

2.3.2 TRANSLATION PRINCIPLES

There are three principles of translation proposed by Nida (1975:27). Those principles mean that no translation in a receptor language can be the exact equivalent of the model in source language. All types of translation involve the following conditions:

- (i) Loss of information
The translation of items in the SL does not explain the whole information in the TL or is not translated or transferred into the TL.

Example:

Eng. SL text: C'est **la** vie.
Fr. TL text: It's life.

- (ii) Addition of information
The translation of items in the source language into target language is with addition of extra information.

Example:

Fr. SL text: Cet été **là**...
Eng. TL text: This summer...

- (iii) Skewing of Information
The translation of items from the source language is not the exact equivalence in the target language.

Example:

Eng. SL text: He **makes the bed** every morning. (He cleans and tidy the bed every morning.)
Fr. TL text: Il **fait du lit** tous les matins. (He produces the bed every morning)

III RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A poem is a literary work containing connotation and emotion in imagination written in with certain rhyme, rhythm, and imagery. The Indonesian poem – e.g. the second stanza – has a-a-a-a rhyme (the last vowel sound in each line), but in their translations, they become i-e-e-u. The rhymes in every stanza cannot be retained in the target language because the translator has to keep the meaning transfer from the SL into TL, though the words have different rhymes. Moreover, the figurative expressions in the SL were translated literally into the TL in order to keep the forms of the SL and avoid more number of words than can affect the length of lines in the TL. There are many shifts occur in the translation of the Indonesian poem “Gestural Tubuh Perempuan” into French as described below.

3.1 LEVEL SHIFTS

SL	→	TL	
1) Gelap	→	Sombre	(line 4)
2) Terang	→	Clair	(line 13)
3) ruang hingar dan gemetar	→	espace bruyant et tremblant	(line 23)
4) fana dan telanjang.	→	éphémère et nu.	(line 24)
5) Barangkali	→	peut-être	(line 28)

The SL adjectives (data 1 and 2), noun phrase (data 3), and adjective phrase (data 4) have a TL translation equivalent in the TL. Data 5 is a compound word that is also translated into a compound word with a dash (-) mark. There is no loss, addition, or skewing of information in the translations.

3.2 CATEGORY SHIFTS

(i) Structure Shifts

SL	→	TL	
6) <i>Kereta perjamuan <u>masuk di dalamnya</u>.</i>	→	<i>La carriole aux mets <u>y pénètre</u>.</i>	(line 3)
7) aku menjeja <u>jantungku sendiri</u>	→	j'épèle <u>mon propre cœur</u>	(line 25)
8) <u>kelopak nasahmu</u> mengigau	→	<u>ton enveloppe humide</u> délire	(line 29)

Structure shifts can be found in these three data. Data 6 has a structure inversion of the position of prepositional phrase *di dalamnya*, where in the SL it is placed after the verb, otherwise, in the TL it is placed before the verb with the preposition *y*. It is clear that the preposition *y* is equivalent with the preposition *di dalamnya*, but there is additional information *la* (article), and *aux* (preposition) in the TL. In data 7, there is a structure inversion in the SL noun phrase *jantungku sendiri* into *mon propre cœur* in the TL, in which the possessive pronoun *-ku* is attached after the noun *jantung*, while in the TL, it is placed before the noun phrase *propre cœur*, there is no loss of information in this translation. The same thing happened in data 8, where the possessive pronoun *-mu* is attached after the noun *nasah* in the SL and in the TL the possessive pronoun *ton* is placed before the noun *enveloppe*. In terms of meaning, the SL figurative language *kelopak nasah* means the desire inside the heart, and is literally translated into *enveloppe humide* which does not express the desire of someone's heart, therefore, it is said that it has skewing of information.

(ii) Class Shifts

SL	→	TL	
9) <u>berulang-ulang</u>	→	<u>encore et encore</u>	(line 7)

Data 9 contains a shift from a compound adverb into an adverbial phrase. There is an equivalent transfer of meaning from the SL into the TL, even though the word class of the SL has changed in the TL.

(iii) Unit Shifts

SL	→	TL	
10) <u>bersentuhan</u> .	→	<u>nous toucher</u> .	(line 8)

There is one word in the SL that is *bersentuhan* that consists of the prefix *ber-* + noun *sentuh* (touch) + suffix *-an* in which the addition of prefix and suffix to the verb means touching each other. It is translated into two words in the TL. It shows the unit shift with the addition of the word *nous* to the verb *toucher* 'to touch' in the TL to retain the meaning in the SL.

(iv) Intra-system Shifts

SL		TL (Addition of definite article)	
11) rasakan <u>hawa</u> dingin	→	sentir l' <u>air froid</u>	(line 6)
12) memutar <u>kerinduan</u> pada hasrat	→	tourne <u>la nostalgie</u> en désir	(line 16)
13) di <u>jalan</u>	→	de <u>la rue</u>	(line 22)
14) membuka <u>mata</u>	→	ouvrant <u>les yeux</u>	(line 26)
15) melebur <u>sunyi</u>	→	fondre <u>le silence</u>	(line 31)
16) mereguk <u>kekal</u>	→	savoure <u>l'éternité</u>	(line 32)

In SL data, each noun is not preceded by a definite article and all countable and uncountable nouns are not written with plural markers, but in the translations, there exist the definite articles *l'* (followed by uncountable noun with vowel sound in initial position of the word as in data 11, 16), *la* (followed by a countable noun-feminine, as in data 12, 13), *les* (followed by an countable noun in plural form, as in data 14), and *le* (followed by an uncountable noun-masculine, as in data 31). The addition of definite articles in the TL show whether the nouns are singular, plural, feminine or masculine. Indonesian does not have the classification of feminine and masculine for nouns and also definite article like those used in French and like the in English, it has only the information about countable and uncountable nouns.

SL		TL (Addition of indefinite article)	
17) <u>Lorong</u> gelap	→	<u>Une ruelle</u> sombre	(line 2)
18) menggambar <u>kepala</u> dan <u>tangga</u>	→	dessinent <u>une tête</u> et <u>un escalier</u>	(line 10)
19) menggambar <u>kepala</u> dan <u>tangga</u>	→	dessine <u>une tête</u> et <u>un escalier</u>	(line 15)

The countable nouns in singular forms in the SL are translated in the same forms but with the additional of indefinite articles *une* (with feminine noun) and *un* (with masculine noun). The nouns have additional information with the gender marker in the TL. Indonesian definite article is different from French. The form is 'se- + information that modifies the noun + noun', for instance: *sebuah apel*/an apple (modifies the fruit), *seekor kucing*/a cat (modifies the animal), etc.

SL		TL (Addition of one article + partitive article)	
20) Gestural <u>Tubuh Perempuan</u>	→	<u>Les gestes du corps féminin</u>	(title)
21) di mana <u>isyarat ayat</u>	→	où <u>les symboles des versets</u>	(line 11)
22) sunyikan <u>belahan bulan</u> .	→	dissimulent <u>un quartier de lune</u> .	(line 12)

The SL noun phrases are translated into noun phrases with the definite article *les* in data 20 and 21 before the head nouns, and followed by other partitives *du* (followed by another noun phrase in data 20) and *des* (followed by another plural noun in data 21). Article *les* is the definite article for plural noun. Therefore, there is addition of information, where in the SL the noun is singular but translated into the plural noun. The noun phrase in data 22 is also

IV CONCLUSION

The figurative language in the SL poem is translated literally into the TL, not figuratively. The shifts of the figurative expressions in the poem from the SL into the TL occur in all types. The shifts that frequently occur are in the intra-system of the language. There is only a few loss of information in the shifts, but a lot of addition of information especially for the use of French articles, those are the addition of definite, indefinite, partitive articles, and prepositions before nouns in the TL. Skewing of information can be found in two data, it happened because the translations of SL figurative languages do not have the equivalent in the TL.

REFERENCES

- Anggana, Rezki Lintang. 2012. "Textual Elements and Translation Methods of Toeti Heraty's Poems Translated by Ulrich Kratz" (A Thesis). Available on: http://eprints.dinus.ac.id/5988/1/full_thesis.pdf.
- Catford, J.C. (Translation Shifts) in Venuti, Lawrence. 2000. *The Translation Studies Reader*. London: Routledge.
- Forum Jakarta-Paris, Alliance Francais de Denpasar. 2010. *Couleur Femme*. Bogor: Grafika Mardi Yuana Press.
- Hornby, A. S. 2000. *Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary of Current English*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Newmark, P. (1988a). *A Textbook of Translation*. Hertfordshire: Prentice Hall.
- Nida, Eugene A. 1974. *Theory and Practice of Translation*. Leiden: E. J. Brill.
- Nida. E.A. (1975). *Language Structure and Translation*. Essays by Nida. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

