Culinary Versus Gastronomy
Argumentum Ad Populum Elimination

Amiluhur Soeroso¹ and Dewi Turgarini ²

¹STIPRAM Yogyakarta
²Indonesia University of Education Bandung

Corresponding Author: amisoeroso@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Received 8 June 2020
Accepted 31 August 2020
Available online 30 September 2020

ABSTRACT

Food becomes one of main income of tourism sector which supports Gross Domestic Product. Food and beverage is also suspected to be the tourists’ motivation for travelling. People, publicly, and government recognize it more as culinary. However, there is a view that argumentation which is constructed by public seems to be not accordance with the real situation. Gastronomy, which accommodates foodshed, cooking, until foodscape and human behaviour, is perceived to be more appropriate as a comparison argument. Related to that matter, in this paper, researcher is trying to study and to compare two-sided definition of terminology over culinary and gastronomy as a way to eliminate argumentum ad populum.

Keywords: culinary, gastronomy, foodshed, foodscape, argumentum ad populum

INTRODUCTION

Tourism now has become a sexy world to supply the state finances. In the State speech on Friday, August 16th 2019 at DPR MPR RI (Parliament) Building, Senayan Jakarta, the president of Indonesia conveyed that the foreign exchange obtained from tourism sector had reached US$ 19.29 billion from 15.8 million foreign tourists in 2018 with Average Spending per Arrival (ASPA) was US$ 1,220 per arrival.

The contribution of tourism sector towards Gross Domestic Product in 2019 raised 4.80 percent compared to that in 2018 that reached 4.50 percent. Some contributor sectors of Gross Domestic Product are food, accommodation, and food and beverage provider in small enterprises had an encouraging increase (Table 1). This sector has much related to tourism business. The data in 2019 seems to be relieving. Gross Domestic Product of business in each sector went beyond that in 2018.
Unfortunately, in 2020 there is an anomaly in tourism sector. The plague Covid-19 attack has made it apparent death even half collapse and must change the way of doing business. However, post pandemic Covid-19, this sector is believed to show back the significant contribution over Gross Domestic Product of Indonesia.

Table 1. Gross Domestic Product Based on Small Scale Enterprise (IDR)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PDB Lapangan Usaha</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
<th>2019</th>
<th>2020 *)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food Plant</td>
<td>438,889.50</td>
<td>449,732.10</td>
<td>446,869.50</td>
<td>115,527.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horticulture Plant</td>
<td>197,325.60</td>
<td>218,713.20</td>
<td>238,830.50</td>
<td>56,902.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plantation Crops</td>
<td>471,466.40</td>
<td>489,185.60</td>
<td>517,507.80</td>
<td>123,138.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal Husbandry</td>
<td>213,780.80</td>
<td>232,274.70</td>
<td>257,007.90</td>
<td>65,522.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural and Hunting Services</td>
<td>26,063.90</td>
<td>27,593.20</td>
<td>29,307.00</td>
<td>7,533.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fishery</td>
<td>348,827.60</td>
<td>385,908.00</td>
<td>419,982.20</td>
<td>109,637.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accommodation Provider</td>
<td>91,953.30</td>
<td>96,571.70</td>
<td>99,160.50</td>
<td>23,635.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food and Beverage Provider</td>
<td>295,059.80</td>
<td>316,138.00</td>
<td>341,107.20</td>
<td>86,111.10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: BPS/ Central Bureau of Statistics (2020)
Note: *) quarterly I-2020

Food (including drink) or also known as food and beverage is a promising tourism supporting element. In the world of tourism, food is often related, or is discussed from various aspects like its origin, to taste, aroma, raw material, spices, processing places, way of processing, even to research, consumer behaviour and so on.

In 2019, accommodation provider sector as well as food and beverage, as main indicator of tourism activity, increased 5.8% (y.o.y). This high growth was supported by food and beverage sector (6.9%), whereas the growth of accommodation provider sector precisely decreased 1.3%. Perhaps, it happened because of disruption caused by technology(application) of accommodation provider in tourist destination which could decrease the hotel occupation (Revindo et al., 2020). Therefore, the performance of food and beverage is significant towards tourism sector in Indonesia that needs to be supported to keep on growing.

![Figure 1. The Growth of Accommodation and Food and Beverage Provider Sector](http://ojs.unud.ac.id/index.php/eot)
A tour, which is food and beverage designed as the main purpose, becomes a tourist motivation factor to travel. This tourism includes in cultural category (NIOS, 2018) and identified with “food tourism” or “tasting tourism”. Indonesian government through Tourism Department since 2012 has been using “culinary” term to express a tourism that is related to food so that stipulate it as an icon (Kemenpar, 2012). There are various terminologies for the food field spoken by common people. They call it cookery, cuisine, dish, banquet, catering, culinary, gastronomy and so on. The last two terms is interesting topic since has become a contradiction very often, even an exciting debate among the supporters.

Therefore, the aim of this paper is to find a point over the term of culinary and gastronomy in line with the designation. Surely, this is so as not to become an argentum ad populum in tourism.

CULINARY

Culinary is derived from the word culinary as an adjective (kūˈlin-ar-i) which relates to a kitchen or cuisine or something uses a kitchen. The word culinary is rooted from Latin culinarius or culina means a kitchen (Chambers 20th Century Dictionary, 2019). In ancient English, culinary is written as cyln means cooking. The first word of culinary was written in 1638, and then re-introduced by the Humanists sourced from classic Latin in the 16th century (Engyes, 2019).

Culinary is an art, a way, a technique of food cooking around or relates to a kitchen. The word culinary is connected with cooking, especially as a developed skill or art (Cambridge, 2020). Vocabulary (2020) explained, culinary means having to do with cooking or the kitchen. If you go to culinary school, you're learning how to cook, most likely because you want to work as a chef. Foxeslovelemons (2013) said “What I Learned in Culinary School” series, I’ll be sharing tips and tricks that I learned from two years of working with some of the country’s best chefs. This will include big things like learning to work efficiently, and small things like how to cook bacon perfectly. All of them will be applicable to your home kitchen, making you a faster, better, and more confident cook. Of course, once again, this is only conducted in the kitchen area.

“Culinary” refers to an adjective (culinary art, culinary school, and so on). Culinary art is based on food, preparation, aesthetic, and everything depends on different cultures or location where it is developed, or relates to a kitchen of cuisine. Culinary is about cooking food relates to cooking practices or cooking activities.
GASTRONOMY

Gastronomy is derived from a French (1800-1900) gastronomie which is adopted from ancient Greek (αστρονομία) gastronómia. Gastro or gastér means “stomach”, while nómos (γαστήρ and νόμος) means knowledge or law. So, gastro is understood as “cooking” and nomi means “a rule or a law system about certain field”. Cooking skills continued to develop as an actual field of study until 1800s. Instead of just learning how to cook food, people began to focus on how food became an experience – how senses interacted to create complete dish to enjoy. France, of course, was the first to claim the title and field as theirs.

If look further to the past time, Archestratus in the 4th BC mentioned gastronomy “pleasure to pursue delicacy”. He wrote a book “Gastronmia”, which generally means “a rule for stomach”, contained an eating guide (Santich, 1996). In the modern era, Gastronomy began to reintroduce in 1803 by Jaques Delille Joseph de Berchoux (2015), a French writer. He wrote a poetry “la gastronomie ou l’homme des champs à table (Gastronomy, or the peasant at the table)”.

There are many researchers like Soeroso (2014a), Soeroso and Susilo (2013), Lilholt (2015), Shenoy (2005), Manolis (2010), Sintich (2010), Pullphothong and Sopha (2013) who stated that the focus of gastronomy is not merely culinary in the kitchen but also relates to the ins and outs of cultures, especially human behaviour in selecting raw material, and then in tasting, feeling, serving the food and having consuming experience, as well as in seeking, learning, researching and writing about food and everything relates to ethics, etiquette and nutrition for people in different countries (Figure 2).

Figure 1. Gastronomy

Gastronomy is one of those terms often tossed around in the culinary field, used to define everything from fine dining experiences to specific studies of the chemical manipulation of food. While popular use puts the word almost always in
the hands of chefs and cooks, gastronomy actually goes beyond cooking to define the food world as a whole. From the science of human digestion to the study of cultures and the way they interact with food, gastronomy is all about the relationship between humans, food, and the world we live in (Reluctant Gourmet, 2011).

Gastronomy is an art and a science, even cross ethnic, nation, race, group, religion, gender and culture appreciation by learning how to eat, food and beverage in detail to use in various conditions and situations. Other dimension of gastronomy is its characteristic connects to food, meal and living environment (physically, biologically or culturally) of cultivation place of food sources or often called foodshed. One of examples is agricultural cultivation has significant relation to aroma, taste, food colour, even original point or place, environment of raw material and human behaviour or the maker’s nation (Soeroso, 2014a, 2014b). Differentially, gastronomy has practical (conversing food to dishes), theoretical (closely with food science) and technical (performance, system evaluation) field of study, as well as food product development, molecular (a transformation of food physio-chemical), geography, history, tourism and so on.

Gastronomy associated with foodshed (Feagan, 2007), a geographic region that produces the food for a particular population. The term is used to describe a region of food flows, from the area where it is produced, to the place where it is consumed, including: the land it grows on, the route it travels, the markets it passes through, and the tables it ends up on. Foodshed, according to Kloppenburg et al. (1996), describe as socio-geographical space, where human activity is embedded in the natural integument of a particular place.

Gastronomy also relates to food landscape which means a food spatial distribution (Sobal & Wansink, 2007; Winson, 2004; Johnston & MacKendrick, 2009), ecological site (Johnston & MacKendrick, 2009), institutional arrangements (Sobal & Wansink, 2007), a structure in community who establishes food environment (Burgoine et al., 2009), the system of production, chain, ethic and food policy (Freidberg, 2010). Foodscape can be visualized as a location, a place for food to display or to serve for consumption or buying (Brembeck & Johansson, 2010), or a space relates to food and eating, including services as a part of food consumption as well (Winson, 2004). Foodscape is a socio-cultural construction of system relation between food products with the space as well as their attributes and the meaning of the food place consumed or explored (Knasko et al., 1990; Zukin, 1991; Winson, 2004; Sobal & Wansink, 2007); or
according to Dolphijn (2005) is an interaction process among what the food is, where the location is and who the food consumer is. Therefore, it is obvious that foodscape is an inseparable part from gastronomy. Consumers will come to enjoy food products, as well as to have conversations while enjoying the atmosphere of the space of that food service provider, and finally they just buy experiences of food eating.

In relation to tourism, the International Culinary Tourism Association defines gastronomy as "the pursuit of unique and memorable eating and drinking experiences" (Manolis, 2010). Chaney and Ryan (2012) identify that gastronomic tourism is one of tourism activities newly known by public. Thus the gastronomy tourists are those who are willing to travel other places for tasting and seeking experiences over authentic local food in destinations (Pullphothong & Sopha, 2013).

WHY DOES GASTRONOMY RELATE TO CULTURE?

Culture is a characteristic and knowledge of group of people comprises language, religion, cuisine, social habit, music and art. The word “culture” derives from French term which taken from Latin “colere”, means tend to the earth and to grow, or cultivation and nurturing. Culture (KBBI, 2019) is a thought, customs and common sense. The derivation word of culture is culture which means a way of human thinking and acting. Culture (Koentjaraningrat, 2015) is a whole system of ideas, actions and creations of human beings in their lives. Culture also becomes one’s own of human beings by learning. Then what does culture relate to gastronomy?

Eagleton (1997) argued that gastronomy emphasizes on food as core component of each culture. As a part of culture, authenticity eating is a combination of joyful, utility and social, while food is a dictionary of heart situation and sensation (Ellmann, 1993), so that the relation between human beings and their food (as cultural product) is characteristic. So, selection on kinds and how the food is consumed will become a marker for identity and differences (Richards, 2012, 2015). This perspective indicates food is not merely energy, but also comprises widely meaning as a means to increase the quality of life, of a vehicle for socializing, to enrich experiences, to reveal identity or social status and even to become conflict prevention, and to protect the homeland. Therefore, regardless of how to serve, both locals and tourists who visit a tourist destination, they consistently determine their gastronomy choices according to their
social class identity, which in turn will show power and control of social and economy hierarchically (Everett, 2009).

Some simple examples shows that gastronomy is a part of culture which can be seen from the presence of Tumpeng, Kerupuk and Bakar Batu. Tumpeng is not only as rice eaten along with side dishes, but also personifies a relation between macro cosmos and micro cosmos, between the creator and the creation (Indogastronomy, 2016). Tumpeng is used in various social traditional occasions. Kerupuk is originally food for poor people (detikfood, 2017). Previously, this product was made as an effort of the remaining rice efficiency so that it is not wasted. Then the remaining rice is dried by drying it in the sun. After that, it is processed to become raw ingredient which then fried to become Kerupuk. Both foods are recognized internationally as authentic Indonesian food. Meanwhile, the tradition of Bakar Batu is a way of people in Papua to celebrate birth, wedding, designation of tribal chief and so on. They cook food flanked by stacked stones on fire and burned until the firewood burn out, so that the stones are blazing heat. Those stones are arranged in a hole which has been previously dug. After all ingredients are put in the hole and flanked by those stacked stones, wait until cooked.

Figure 2. Gastronomy Product Development
Source: Turgarini (2018)

Food as cultural a cultural product (see Figure 3), previously, was an “elementary product” as a consumption means to fulfil human’s basic needs to survive. However, the function of food was then transformed as “existence product” commercially and transactional, even though the food is still the same as the previous product. On the third step, food product benefit is now polished and enriched with art, special skill and technique through processing, cooking and then presenting it so that resulting “palate or taste product” where taste, aroma, display begin to be important to raise consumers’ appetite and also healthy. The next step, food is like a fulfilment of nutrition standard, quality of life, social, experience, status, conservation to national defence. In the top, food is enriched and
positioned as “gastronomy product” which can become attraction due to comprises elementary function, benefit, joyful, happiness, curiosity fulfilment, as well as social aspects (Turgarini, 2018).

Therefore, culinary process still becomes a part of each gastronomic culture stage. Cooking itself is a food processing process from level one to five on gastronomy product. However, culinary area is only around kitchen. This is different from gastronomy which adopts all food ecosystem starts from foodshed to foodscape and dining tables even post enjoying the served dishes.

**ARGUMENTUM AD POPULUM ELIMINATION**

Nowadays, culinary has become vocabulary for anything relates to food (including raw ingredient, foodscape, and consumers’ behaviour). This term is considered to be true because it has been used by mostly public even government officials. However, in this case, actually there is an argumentum ad populum, in logic, is a fallacious argument that concludes a proposition to be true because many or all people believe it alleges, if many believe so, it is so. This type of argument is known by several names, including appeal to the masses, appeal to belief, appeal to the majority, appeal to the people, argument by consensus, authority of the many, and bandwagon fallacy, and in Latin by the names *argumentum ad populum, argumentum ad numerum, and consensus gentium* (Miller et al., 2009).

From the explanation above, the argument that has been used “culinary is the same as gastronomy” is not appropriate in use. Argumentum ad populum means “asking people’s opinion is considered to be true due to be believed by many people”. *Argumentum ad populum* is a form of relevant digression, namely a digression emerges whenever a conclusion taken is not relevant with or is not a logic implication from its premise that makes people fooled.

The *Argumentum ad Populum* is an argument, often emotionally laden, that claims a conclusion is true because most, all, or even an elite group people irrelevantly think, believe, or feel that it is. This argument is characterized here with many examples and shown to be sometimes persuasive but normally fallacious if there is no direct relevant evidence presented for the truth of its conclusion. In other words, *argumentum ad Populum* (an appeal to popularity, public opinion or to the majority) is an argument, often emotively laden, for the acceptance of an unproved conclusion by adducing irrelevant evidence based on the feelings, prejudices, or beliefs of a large group of people (Philosophy, 2020).
Culinary is mentioned to connect with kitchen and cuisine (Merriam-Webster, 2020), connected with cooking or food (oxfordlearnersdictionaries, 2020); of, relating to, or used in cooking or the kitchen (Dictionary, 2020), so that becomes a part of gastronomy processing stages, and not vice versa (see Figure 2). The meaning of gastronomy is widely compared to culinary begin from choosing the ingredient, cooking in the kitchen (culinary), tasting, serving, seeking eating unique food experience, ethic and etiquette of culinary art up to the food enters the stomach and nurturing the consumers. Beyond that, gastronomy also relates to research and writing about food.

CONCLUSION

The definition of gastronomy has a broad spectrum, from foodshed (a place for cultivation and distribution of food) up to foodscape (a place for food to serve as well as dining table as a place for serving food) even goes beyond the limits, that seeking eating experience, researching and writing about food still become a part of its ecosystem. Meanwhile culinary is merely a partially process of gastronomy. Culinary habitat does no relate to foodshed, while its foodscape is only limited to cooking space as a form of cooking activity or only around kitchen.

Therefore, the use of pronunciation and definition of culinary to co-optation all eating food procession is not appropriate. The understanding of culinary in the micro order cannot be congruent or has not the same meaning as gastronomy in macro level. There are many people, starts from common people up to government officials misled on argumentum ad populum with relevance error making meaning confusion between culinary and gastronomy.

This case has become a misleading accepted by public. Hence, the term of culinary and gastronomy as eating culture should be return to each position and be used according to the meaning. Tourism Ministry along with tourism departments in all provinces in the Republic of Indonesia can initiate the confusion justification of the term. However, the provision of food and beverage is a significant support for tourism.

REFERENCES


