POWER RELATIONS PRACTICES IN HIGHER EDUCATION ELECTRONIC LIBRARY IN BALI

I Putu Suhartika¹, I Wayan Ardika², I Ketut Ardhana, I Nengah Punia⁴

¹D3 Library, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Udayana University
², ³Cultural Studies Study Program, Faculty of Arts, Udayana University, ⁴Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Udayana University

Email: ¹ suhardharma@yahoo.com, ²ardikawayan52@gmail.com,
 ³phejepsdrlipi@yahoo.com, ⁴INengahPunia@unud.ac.id

ABSTRACT

Electronic library is apart of the implementation of information and communication technology in libraries as mandated in Law No. 43 of 2007 and SNP 010: 2011. There are various obstacles in developing electronic library which are especially related to the power relations of actors. Therefore, this study aims to analyze the practice of power relations in the electronic libraries of universities in Bali so that the processes, forms, and implications of these power relations can be revealed.

This study uses 17 (seventeen) library actors consisting of the Head of the Library, Vice Chancellor I, Librarians, Programmers, and Users spread over 5 (five) universities in Bali as informants who were interviewed semi-structured. This study uses Foucault's theory of power relations as a grand theory, and is supported by Derrida's theory of deconstruction and Gramsci's hegemony. The results showed that the practice of power relations in university libraries in Bali is mainly based on the actor's knowledge. This is in accordance with Foucault's perspective where knowledge can produce power in the electronic library. However, the practice is also based on the structural position of actors, so that power relations are not always balanced, but also in the form of domination, negotiation, and hegemony which are depicted in power frames. The practice has good implications for libraries, especially for users, librarians, programmers, and library collections, although in certain cases, power relations provide gaps between these actors.

Keywords: electronic library, power relation, domination, deconstruction, and hegemony

INTRODUCTION

The rapid development of information and communication technology (ICT) in the era of globalization can change human civilization, ranging from the civilization of traditional societies, industrial societies to the information society, which is a society that is highly dependent on information, in this case, information is information. is something that must exist
(sine que non) for humans. The development of information technology causes libraries to become more modern, so that at this time, we are familiar with various library terms such as electronic libraries, hybrid libraries, digital libraries, and library 2.0.

In line with this, the Government has addressed the implementation of information and communication technology in libraries by issuing Law Number 43 of 2007 concerning Libraries, where several articles in the Act contain the implementation of information and communication technology in university libraries. The implementation of information and communication technology is also regulated in the National Standards for Higher Education Libraries No. 10 of 2011.

One manifestation of the implementation of information and communication technology in libraries as mandated in Law No. 43 of 2007 and SNP 010: 2011 is an electronic library. With these regulations, the development of electronic libraries should be able to run optimally. However, the implementation of the law did not run optimally, so that the journey of the library to the electronic library did not always go as expected given the various obstacles, especially related to the power relations of actors. The various interests of the actors involved in the development of the library can influence the practice of power relations. Therefore,

METHODOLOGY

This study used 17 (seventeen) internal and external library actors consisting of the Head of the Library, Deputy Chancellor I, Librarian, Programmer, Lecturer Librarian and Student Librarian spread over 5 (five) universities in Bali as resource persons who were interviewed in a semi-structured manner. This study uses Foucault's theory of power relations as a grand theory, and is supported by the deconstruction theory of Derrida and Gramsci's Hegemony. The concept of power from Michel Foucault is part of the 'genealogy' method which in this study is associated with the power of electronic library actors. The deconstruction method is used to analyze the actor's ideology. While Gramsci's theory of hegemony is used to examine actor leadership based on consensus or agreement.
RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The results of the study show that the practice of power relations in university electronic libraries in Bali occurs from the planning stage to the system implementation stage. However, this study focuses on the practice of power relations at the planning stage, development of electronic collections, and use of electronic library software. In addition, the practice of power relations is also associated with discursive practice where knowledge and language are studied.

The practice of power relations at the planning stage of the electronic library involves the library's internal and external actors, namely the Head of the Library, Library IT Staff, Librarian, Vice Chancellor I, and University IT Staff. The practice of power relations in the development of electronic collections involves the head of the library, librarian and vice chancellor I, while the practice of power relations at the stage of using electronic library software involves the head of the library, programmers, library IT staff, university IT staff, and librarians. Of all these actors, the Head of the Library has a dominant role in all these stages considering that the Head of the Library is always present at each stage of the activity.

The practice of power relations in electronic libraries gives birth to its own form of power according to the role of the actor. The forms of power relations are equality, domination, negotiation, and hegemony. The form of power relations can be described in terms of power, such as power triangles, power quadrilaterals, and so on.

The practice of power relations has implications for libraries, especially users, librarians, programmers, and library collections. Overall, the practice of power relations in university electronic libraries in Bali has positive implications for these actors, although in certain cases, power relations provide gaps or gaps between these actors.

Practice of Power Relations in Electronic Library Planning

The practice of power relations at the planning stage was first seen when the idea of developing an electronic library was presented by the actor, where at first the Head of the Library had the idea and conveyed it to other actors to get input on the idea, as conveyed by Griadhi:

The head of the library has an idea, the idea is conveyed to WR I, WR I calls the Head of the Puskom to be seated together there is an agreement He is the head of the team who is not the deputy and the members are lecturers (Interview July 23, 2020)
The informant's statement above shows that the Head of the Library conveyed the idea to the Vice Chancellor I, and then WR I closed it with the Head of Puskom and the Head of the Library. After reaching an agreement, the Vice Chancellor I formed a Development Team that contained elements of the UPT Puskom, Libraries, and lecturers. Finally, the team started working on the system according to the guidelines in the IT Division. The Vice Chancellor I's commitment to the development of electronic libraries was shown by agreeing to the proposal submitted by the Head of the Library, as conveyed by Wiryawan as follows:

I immediately agreed with the proposal for the development of an electronic library by the head of the library, considering that the need for such development should no longer be tolerated, in accordance with the demands of current higher education governance needs. (Interview January 24, 2021)

The statements of the two informants above show that the practice of power relations in electronic libraries occurs when the head of the library's ideas are conveyed to other actors. The head of the library makes contact with other actors in an effort to realize his idea. The practice of power relations at the planning stage is based on the interests of various actors so that power relations have their own form of power.

Overall, the practice of power relations in the planning mentioned above is based on the knowledge of each actor as conveyed by several actors involved in the planning. Artayasa invites other actors in a power relation to remember they have knowledge about libraries and libraries related to electronics (Interview 19 February 2021). This is also confirmed by Artadi and Sanjiwani. Artadi said that all actors involved were selected based on their knowledge in the IT field (19 February 2021), while Sanjiwani said that electronic libraries require human resources who understand electronics and the systems that will be developed in the library (Interview 28 December 2020).

In connection with the above, the knowledge of actors plays an important role in power relations. With this knowledge, actors can engage in power relations. Thus, it can be said that knowledge can produce power, in this case, the knowledge of the Head of the Library gives birth to the power to plan or make proposals for electronic libraries, while the Vice Chancellor I has the power to make policies for the development of electronic libraries. The relationship between knowledge and power in electronic library planning was also conveyed by Sudarma as follows:

We need their competence to build an electronic system, not because WR 1 just ordered it, but it is in WR 1’s interest to order to build a system, but building the system
requires competent people in this competent field, which requires other parties to do WR1 together by chance. Puskon is under it WR1 instructs staff at WR1 staff at Puskom to help staff at the library (Interview 11 January 2021)

The informant's statement above shows that the power of the actors is not related to the position or position of each actor, so that power does not seem to have a negative meaning, however, the power is related to the knowledge of the actor. More specifically, the relationship between knowledge and power is conveyed by Wiryawan as follows:

I invite the actor because he has the competence, knowledge and authority in the development of the electronic library, it is to maintain that the library development program is in accordance with the directions and objectives that have been set. (Interview January 24, 2021)

The informant's statement above shows that power relations in the development of electronic libraries require not only knowledge but also the power (authority) of actors related to electronic libraries. Thus, the power relation in electronic library planning places knowledge with power in that relation.

From the description above, it can be said that Foucault's theory of the relation of power and knowledge can be applied in planning electronic libraries for universities in Bali, where Foucault in Lubis (2004, 165-167) places knowledge as the power of actors who work positively and productively, not power in a repressive and operative sense through asymmetrical relationships that lead to dominance between subject and object in maintaining power. Power operates in knowledge relations to normalize the structure, rules, and relationships in society. Power that is spread in society tends to establish relationships between powers which are often understood as power relations.

Practice of Power Relations in Electronic Collection Development

Collection development is an activity that needs to be carried out by libraries in an effort to fulfill collections that are relevant, current and accurate for their users. In this regard, collection development is carried out through a systematic process from planning to evaluation of collection development policies. Collection development is a process of activities that includes a number of activities related to establishing and coordinating selection policies, assessing the needs of users and potential users, reviewing collection users, evaluating collections, identifying collection needs, selecting library materials, planning to work together, maintaining collections, and weeding (Hartono, 2016: 69).
The development of electronic collections can be done through purchases, donations, exchanges, and transfer of media or digitization. Electronic collections are also known as digital collections. The nature of this collection is (a) full text materials and resources, including e-journals, open access digital collections, e-books, e-newspapers, theses, and dissertations. digital, (b) metadata resources, including digital software in the form of catalogs, indexes and abstracts, or resources that provide information on other secondary literature), (c) digital multimedia materials, (d) various sites on the internet (Pendit: 2009) . In general, electronic collections subscribed to by university libraries in Bali are e-books and e-journals, while digitizing electronic collections is carried out through a scanning process (scanning of printed form to digital), editing (editing or processing digital files or files (PDF) in in a computer, and uploading (uploading to a digital library).The development of an electronic collection of an electronic library for higher education in Bali was proposed by the Head of the Library and approved by the Vice Chancellor I, as conveyed by Putri as follows:

The collection development process is based on submissions every semester from us, so first we also communicate with study programs about what books are needed, if we submit a purchase, then it will be approved later, the message from us is according to the list and after it is approved the payment will be from the rectorate, so we ask for an offer first we will share it with the study program, the study program also chooses (Interview 28 December 2020)

The process of developing the electronic collection of university libraries in Bali above gave birth to a power relationship between the Head of the Library and the Vice Chancellor I. The power relationship is based more on the knowledge of each actor so that the power of the two actors is balanced. However, the power relations between these actors are not always balanced considering that the structural power of actors can dominate other actors, as stated by Griadhi as follows:

:::now don't buy e-journals, previously bought them at Sage,... according to the rector, you can't buy journals because they have been bought by the National Library of Indonesia, Dikti, just use them, right, maybe the budget doesn't exist either...Don't buy journals because we've already subscribed to Dikti, even though maybe some universities still buy it..." (Interview July 23, 2020)

When a proposal is rejected by the Vice Chancellor I, usually the Head of the Library gives consideration to his proposal so that the Vice Chancellor I understands it and finally gives approval as conveyed by Sanjiwani below:
it’s not that it’s not unfunded, there was a miscommunication between us because the library wasn't there before, it was in the library before but it was transferred to LPPM, now since I became head of us, the library that manages Turnitin was the fund that became eg not unfunded to eg and that's what we are trying to keep going (Interview 28 December 2020)

The informant's statement above shows that there is a negotiation between the actors so that there is mutual understanding and agreement so that the program can run according to the interests of the actor. Such negotiations can return the actor to his position where the position depends on the knowledge possessed by the actor.

From the description above, it can be said that the practice of power relations in the development of electronic collections for universities in Bali has resulted in a balanced, dominating, and negotiable actor relationship. The relationship between equality and negotiation places knowledge as the power of the actor, while the dominative relationship is associated with the structural position or power of the actor, giving rise to a relationship hierarchical structure which presupposes that there are those who rule and those who are ruled. Therefore, the practice of power relations in the development of electronic collections for universities in Bali raises the link between the underlying knowledge and the power relations that operate behind it. Without knowledge, power is impossible, knowledge is impossible not to give birth to power (Sarup, 2003: 124-128). Besides that, behind the practice of power relations, there is an ideology or desire to channel interests through the actor’s structural position.

**Practice of Power Relations at the Stage of Using Electronic Library Software**

The implementation of information and communication technology (ICT) as mandated in Law No. 43 of 2007 and SNP 010 of 2011 in the form of an electronic library is used by actors to play the will in a practice of power relations. These actors use knowledge in order to gain greater power in these power relations. Thus, the practice of power relations is an arena for ideological contestation or the interests of actors that influence the practice of power relations. Likewise, the use of university library software in Bali, where various ideologies and actors’ interests play behind the practice of power.

The development of higher education electronic libraries in Bali mostly uses SliMS (Senayan Library Management System) software. This software is open source software, where this software is openly accessible and free of charge, unconditional, open source code,
free to modify, and no developer protection. The use of SLiMS as an electronic library system is based on the knowledge of actors who state that SLiMS is free because it can be downloaded freely via the internet, as stated by Artadi, Head of ISI Denpasar Library:

SLiMS (Senayan Library Management System) is included in the best open source category, so it can be obtained for free without paying for a license (Interview 7 January 2021)

From the informant's statement above, the informant believed that SLiMS was free, so it was chosen as an electronic library system in the library. Thus, the selection of a university electronic library system in Bali is based on the user's belief that the SLiMS software is free and can be modified according to system requirements. The belief or knowledge of these actors does not seem to match the fact that the use of SLiMS requires various costs, considering that the implementation of the system cannot be done alone but requires the knowledge of other actors. This is where the ideology of the SLiMS developer actor comes into play. Programmers as actors developing SLiMS hide economic desires behind the free label on the software.

So if, for example, Mas Ari and I developed SLiMS, then I gave an announcement that we are making software, if you want to use it, please pay, I don't think anyone wants to, what are you doing, but with an open source approach, what you get is even more powerful, we are known by many people, people have trust in us, we have brothers (Interview 20 June 2019)

The informant's statement above shows that the creation of SLiMS was initially based on the ideology of open source, which is free to be downloaded, used, edited as needed, and redistributed to users. With this open source ideology, SLiMS is considered as free software for its users. Initially SLiMS was designed together for use by the wider community. This software is used as open source software with various considerations as conveyed by the following informants:

"So, we develop SLiMS, we use three principles. The first principle is early release, so it means that early releases are often released as early as possible. So when a new feature is needed, we try to add it as soon as possible in SLiMS. Then release often, which means release as often as possible so that when it is released often, it turns out to have a good impact. So people see when SLiMS has an update, oh, this software is actively being developed and the software is alive, which means I can rely on this software because sometimes when people use the system, they need confidence that this system is actively developed and continues to live. Then the third listen to your customer."
The informant's statement above indicates that the informant understands the product being developed. This product (system) will function optimally when the number of users increases, so that user confidence in using this system increases. In addition, the informants also understand the culture of the Indonesian people, where the community chooses a system depending on other communities, not on the quality of the system, as conveyed by Wicaksono as follows:

"There's something interesting in Indonesia that sometimes people first choose a software, sometimes it's not a technical consideration but a socio-cultural consideration. For example, like this, for example, if we look at e-prints, e-prints were first, like this e-prints are far inferior in features to d-space but why are e-prints widely used, first it is simple, simpler, then the second I see that there is a point where some libraries use e-prints and then it becomes a boom when many people use e-prints, eventually all of them use e-prints even though the standard is that technically the d space is much more complete. The same thing is similar to SLIMS, SLIMS is a simple feature that we design to hide the complexity of the library database, it's simple but now SLIMS is a feature that's possible too.

The informants above have clearly analyzed the user community, not only from a technical point of view, but also from a socio-cultural perspective. After knowing the characteristics of the system user community, the developer launched the SLIMS system using an open source business model, where the system is uploaded on the internet and the public is free to use it. This model was chosen by the system makers because open source is their idealism. In addition, the system makers also know the culture of the Indonesian people, as stated by Wicaksono as follows:

We also want SLIMS like our ideals to be open source and it turns out that this open source approach is actually more suitable for SLIMS. So if, for example, Mas Ari and I developed SLIMS, then I gave an announcement that we are making software, if you want to use it, please pay, I don't think anyone wants it, what are you doing, but with an open source approach, what you get is even more powerful, we are known by many people, people have trust in us, we have relatives in many places, become resource persons, and so on. In fact, it's even more like that, SLIMS in the end, both developers can live from it. So this approach is using open source and I think in Indonesia people are happy with the open source approach because people see us as a good person who is humanist like that. not very commercial. In Indonesia, it is a bit difficult if we approach it directly commercially or whatever unless we have a large back up fund company (Interview 20 June 2019)

The open source label used by the informants above is very suitable for the Indonesian people. Besides that, system makers get their own labels that will shape their
identity in society, such as someone who is good, humanist, and not commercial, so that people will always need them.

By making SliMS as open source software, the software is known by the public. They start using, downloading, installing, updating, customizing, and so on. When this process is carried out, many users experience technical problems that need to be conveyed to the developer so that there is a power relationship between the developer and the user of the system, in this case, the developer (programmer) and the user of the system have power over the knowledge they have. This relationship aims so that users can use the system optimally, as stated by Gandarini as follows:

Frankly for our library even though we are online for the SLIMS system and the repository system, we don't have our own IT so we communicated with IT at the center and added with outside IT (Interview 6 February 2021)

The informant's statement above shows that SliMS users are very dependent on IT personnel (programmers) so they have to make contact with program makers. This statement was corroborated by the program developer as stated by Wirayuda, the developer of SLiMS December 9, 2020 as follows:

Not immediately, sir, because I slowly guide them until they understand even though they don't really understand.

The informant's statement above shows that the user and the system maker still maintain a relationship, even though the system has been installed in the library. Thus, the relationship gave birth to the practice of power relations between developers and system users.

The practice of power relations above gave birth to actor agreements in the context of optimizing the use of SliMS software. The agreement raises considerable costs that must be borne by the user such as customization and training costs. This is where the actor's (capitalist) economic ideology works, in this case, in the beginning the system makers did not get paid for their products, but in fact, until they were optimally implemented in the library, these products were no longer free. This is recognized by Wicaksono as follows:

… Yes, that's right and it's an open source business model, so it's not the software that's being sold, but the additional services, for example, customizing, display, features or training or maintenance support etc... We are developers on the SLIMS development team, we have confidence when we develop we don't think about it. Money doesn't mean we don't need money, we believe that later if this is a success the money will come from here…(Interview 20 June 2019)
The informant's statement shows that the informant is very understanding about the open source business model. This model was chosen because the developer believes that this model will make money in the future. Thus, it can be said that open source is the ideology of system developers because through open source developers have strong belief in the system created and the user community. In addition, open source does not depend on one developer, but everyone can develop the software. Thus, the ideology of the open source SliMS software is very suitable to be developed in Indonesia, considering that this ideology is very closely related to Indonesia's "gotong royong or togetherness" culture.

The ideology of "open source SliMS" mentioned above has given birth to a power relationship between developers and system users. The ideology gives rise to an ongoing relationship between developers and users. Therefore, the SliMS open source ideology which initially gave birth to the “free” discourse has shifted to “capitalist/paid”. Thus, the "free" discourse gave birth to other ideologies such as capitalist ideology and mutual cooperation.

From this description, it can be said that SliMS as an electronic library system can have implications for software developers and users. The deconstruction of this system has a personal impact on programmers such as new income, promotion or personal branding, and social status. The deconstruction of the SLiMS system is part of the deconstruction of information technology. Deconstruction in the field of information technology is needed considering that technological updates that lead to technological establishment are needed by users. Derrida's concept of deconstruction undermines the concept of binary opposition, where the concept juxtaposes only two meanings, such as black and white, male and female, and the like. Ratna (2005: 250-251), asserts that in contemporary theory,

The deconstruction of the electronic library system that is practiced by the developer (programmer) actually raises a difference in perception between the library as a user of the system and the developer itself, where the library considers the system is still free because it can be downloaded via the internet, but in reality, it is not free, due to the existence of configuration costs and other costs according to the wishes of the library. Thus, the library as a community user of the system who wants a free system (convenience) experiences problems caused by differences in views and ideologies of other actors (programmers). The ideology of this actor has a material existence in social practices, in this case, the ideology can give birth to other ideologies according to the perspective of the actor.
In connection with the above description, the electronic library is a form of ICT implementation as mandated in the Law and the National Standard is a practice of power relations with the ideology at play in it. The actors caught the interest behind the practice. This is where the actor's economic ideology begins to work. Through the knowledge they have, they have established their power in the development of electronic library software, in this case, even though the library is a non-profit institution, this does not affect the actor playing his hidden ideology in power relations. Electronic library software that should be free can be used by these actors for personal gain. Therefore,

DISCOURSE PRACTICES IN UNIVERSITY ELECTRONIC LIBRARIES IN BALI

Discursive practice is a socio-cultural practice that places discourse in social interaction. Discourse here is associated with language and knowledge. Discourse in the sense of language or linguistics is related to text as a result of a production process, while discourse as knowledge is a kind of language that creates knowledge and shapes our understanding of objects and phenomena (Foucault, 1972). Meanwhile, Fairclough in Munfarida (2014:16) offers a discourse model that contains three dimensions, namely text, discursive practice, and social practice. Each of these dimensions has its own area and process and all three are dialectically related. The first dimension is the text which is the result of the production process. The second is a discursive practice related to the interaction of texts with individuals or society in the form of production and interpretation processes. The third dimension is social practice or context that includes socio-cultural practices in which the process of production and interpretation takes place. The discursive practice itself is a form of social practice, and focuses on the processes of production, distribution, and consumption of texts (Lawson, 2008:5). The discursive practice of university electronic libraries in Bali is carried out through the involvement of various actors who have different roles and interests that can affect the sustainability of the practice of power relations in the library. The discursive practice is carried out through language and knowledge.

Discursive practice through language can be found in various social lives, including in libraries. The practice of power relations among university electronic library actors in Bali uses a lot of language (discourse) as a means or media to achieve goals. Exploration of discursive practices in shaping certain subjects occurs in several electronic library development activities, ranging from program planning to the implementation of electronic library systems.
Many words and terms can be used to refer to certain meanings. Fairclough (1998) in Martutik (2014) categorizes words into words of value knowledge and experience, expressiveness, and relationships. These words are important elements in language that can be used in the discursive practices of actors to achieve the desired goal. Several words or terms are often used to influence other actors to carry out these activities in planning the development of electronic libraries. Words such as ebooks and gadgets can arouse the interest of actors to carry out these activities, such as the dialogue carried out by Griadhi as follows:

Head of Library: our library isn't that good actually, shame to show this library
Library Staff: Why is that?
Head of Library: Yes, actually we don't have ebooks, we actually need something like this, I went to Unair, to those who have used it, if I open the gadget it looks like I've opened a book, I want to have something like that, how does it feel, can we?
Staff: Yes. Why can not? (Interview January 21, 2021)

The dialogue above contains words (signs) that provide many meanings that can be clearly understood by the listener. The words used are common words that are often found in a communication such as the word library, ebook, have, and so on. The contents of the dialog contain values that are implied directly through the text marks that appear in the dialog. These values are optimism, modernism, and knowledge. These values are born as a result of the actor's understanding of the words conveyed, where both actors have an understanding of the content of the conversation in the dialogue.

Associated with the word categories given by Fairclough, the contents of the dialogue can be grouped into:

1. Words worth knowledge and experience
   The sentence that contains the word valuable for knowledge and experience is "Yes, actually we don't have an ebook, we actually need something like this, I go to Unair, to those who have used it, when I open the book it's like I have opened a book". This sentence is very thick with knowledge about ebook collections.

2. Words that give an intellectual image such as the word gadget, ebook, and the sentences "if I open the geget it's like I've opened a book" and "we don't have an ebook".

3. The use of words that have expressive value, in the sentence "how does it feel, can we not?" and can. Why can not?"
The short dialogue above contains signs as an instrument to achieve the purpose of the messenger, namely an invitation to develop an electronic library. The use of signs as an element of the language contains the value of knowledge and experience, gives an intellectual image, and has expressive value.

Discursive practice is not only associated with signs as mentioned above, but also with knowledge. In accordance with Foucault's perspective, the discursive practice does not refer to people who practice discourse (language), but to how discourse (knowledge) operates through actors, in this case, Foucault does not again treats discourse as a group of signs (signing elements that refer to content or representations) but as practices that systematically form the object of speech.

Foucault describes, for example, how insanity is spoken of as a part of everyday life and as a mental illness – that it is a discursive object, an object of knowledge (Foucault, 1988). Therefore, in general, discursive practice is called discourse practice. Finken (1998:3) illustrates the computer as a discursive object. The computer is no longer spoken of as a rationalistic controlling tool, but as a tool that contributes to the workers' struggle for a better and more democratic work life. Computers make it possible to talk about users, the relationship between users and designers, and about job skills in certain ways. In connection with this, through computers, the relationship between workers and designers is created as a new discursive object: workers as influential but have strong knowledge and designers as technological humanists, who want to improve democracy and empower weak actors.

Discursive practices also occur in university electronic libraries in Bali. Practices related to how knowledge is generated occur in the process of developing electronic libraries from planning to implementation of electronic library systems. With the discourse of "electronic library" or "e-library" delivered by the actor, the discourse becomes knowledge for actors involved in the development of electronic libraries, as conveyed by Griadhi the following:

“Words or terms such as e-library, ebook, and others can bring up my previous knowledge. Through these words or terms it triggers us to innovate in the implementation of electronic-based library services” (Interview January 21, 2021)

From the informant's statement above, it can be seen that the discourse of "electronic library" refers to the informant's knowledge which refers to electronic-based library services.
The discourse of "electronic library" can explore the previous actor's knowledge. In this regard, this discursive practice is a power relation practice based on knowledge.

**IMPLICATIONS OF POWER RELATIONS**

Electronic library is a library disruption caused by information and communication technology. In this regard, the practice of power relations in higher education electronic libraries in Bali has led to fundamental changes in library operations, information resources, services, staff competencies, and user expectations, as conveyed by Artadi as follows:

> The electronic library program provides a change for the better, especially in the service sector. Users can access information anywhere and anytime. This means that library services have followed and are in line with the development of the character of librarians who have high mobility and are increasingly united with the development of information technology. Besides, the service process is faster and the circulation of collections can be monitored at any time (real time). (Interview January 7, 2021)

The informant's statement above shows that the practice of power relations in electronic libraries can affect the implementation of library activities, in this case, the work can be done quickly and efficiently. The existence of electronic libraries is strongly felt by university library managers in Bali, as stated by Sutrisna, librarian of the Ganesha University of Education as follows:

> Access to information can be done easily and quickly, library services and operations are more effective and efficient. (Interview July 23, 2020)

In addition, the importance of electronic libraries is also felt by users, as conveyed by Puspita Dewi as follows:

> The library system is easy to use, provides a lot of information that I need so I can quickly find the information I need (Interview 2 October 2020)

In connection with the foregoing, the practice of power relations in university electronic libraries in Bali has implications in various aspects of the library, such as the information aspect. Information is a necessity for all parties, including the user, in this case, the user searches for the information needed through the electronic library. Subali states that the user's alignment with electronic libraries is as follows:

> Actually, if I myself tend to go digital, maybe apart from the library here, the National library, and even then, I follow the National Library, there are many collections of books that have been digitized, there are already a lot of books that can be borrowed there for free (Interview 22 February 2021)
The informant's statement above shows that the search for information by users is mostly done through digital media such as electronic libraries because these media provide many conveniences for users. In this regard, the position of the librarian began to be questioned. If the librarian is the party who lacks a "bargaining position", then everything is determined directly by the user. The relationship between librarians and users becomes one-sided. Users can interact directly with the electronic library system. The user has full control over the information provided by the system. Through their knowledge, they can access information anytime and anywhere without the help of a librarian. already can be done from various places without having to come to the library. Besides that, the use of electronic libraries can increase self-confidence and independence, as stated by Yuda the following:

For me, the electronic library really helps me in doing my college assignments, because it is easier to find them, and the results are more accurate (Interview October 5, 2020)

The informant's statement above shows that the informant strongly believes in the importance of electronic libraries so that it raises the confidence and independence of the informants.

Electronic libraries can create a gap (gap) between users and librarians (libraries). Previously, in searching for the information needed, the user came directly to the library and asked the librarian who had sufficient knowledge and experience in the library field. Librarians follow the librarian's instructions because they consider librarians as experts in their fields. However, now their dependence on librarians is no longer visible. The user communicates through the system without face-to-face contact with the librarian, as conveyed by Agnesia as follows:

As a result, my interaction with him personally, compared to maybe a little less, I can immediately see and search without their help (Interview, December 28, 2020)

The presence of higher education electronic libraries in Bali provides an opportunity for users to access various electronic information resources considering that electronic libraries provide accurate search methods and access to information to meet the interests of users. All functions of conventional libraries are carried out by electronic libraries online so that users have the opportunity to access digital resources that are spread not only in certain electronic libraries but on all information provider sites. Thus, the existence of an electronic
library is a necessity, as stated by Wiryawan, Deputy Chancellor I of Mahasaraswati University as follows:

The development of the Electronic Library is a manifestation of the Rector's commitment to improving the quality of libraries according to the demands of today's global development needs… (Interview January 24, 2021)

User awareness of the usefulness of electronic libraries raises user motivation which ultimately affects the acceptance behavior of electronic libraries as stated by the following informants:

Electronic libraries are important and very helpful in finding information so I use them. The electronic library can be accessed from anywhere and anytime, also contains articles, e-journals, and information related to my research, easy to use because I can download it for free, copy it for my writing reference.

The informant's statement above shows a positive perception of users towards the contents and facilities of the electronic library, thereby increasing the desire to use it. The same thing was also conveyed by Sridevi, a student of Maharasaswati University as another:

"I access the electronic library system of my own free will, because the system is good, sir, I like to use it because it provides many choices of information that can be accessed anytime and anywhere so that I use it more often" (Interview 6 February 2021)

The informant's statement shows that the informant uses the electronic library voluntarily of his own free will to fulfill his information needs. The quality of electronic libraries causes users to depend on the system. Electronic libraries can raise awareness of actors to use the system voluntarily. Such awareness leads to increased participation and approval of all system users. Thus, the practice of power relations can give birth to a participatory hegemony of users. Hegemony is a chain of victories that is obtained through a consensus mechanism rather than through oppression of other social classes (Patria, 2015: 120). Gramsci’s concept of hegemony means, in part,

In connection with the description above, it can be said that the practice of power relations in university electronic libraries in Bali has positive and less positive implications for various aspects of libraries such as librarians, users, collections, and system developers.
MEDIATIZATION AND COMMODIFICATION OF LIBRARIES

The practice of actor power relations in the Electronic Libraries of Higher Education in Bali has led to the mediatization and commodification of libraries. Library mediatization is concerned with how the library is mediated. The presence of an electronic library makes the physical library mediated through electronic media so as to form a visualization of an electronic library. In addition, the existence of social media such as Facebook, WhatsApp, Twitter, and Instagram that is attached to the electronic library feature causes the library to be mediated faster. Therefore, library mediatization can reach wider users, considering the presence of an electronic library website can reach global users. The emergence of social media in the global network (internet) has increasingly expanded the reach of users so that the existence of libraries is increasingly felt, finally libraries are no longer public spaces for library institutions, but are public spaces throughout the world.

Mediatization of university electronic libraries in Bali is carried out through various media such as library websites, social media and so on as shown in Table 6.1 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Unud</th>
<th>Undiksha</th>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
<th>Unmas</th>
<th>stikom</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Library website</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Facebook</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Instagram</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Youtube</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Foursquare</td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Blogspot</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Processed from field data for 2020

Table 6.1 above shows that mediatization of university electronic libraries in Bali is carried out through 6 (six) types of media, namely library websites, Facebook, Instagram, Youtube, Foursquare and Blogspot. Of all these media, the library website is the main media for
university libraries in Bali in visualizing the existence of the library. Some examples of these media are shown in Figure 6.1 below:

![Figure 6.1](image)

**Figure 6.1**
**Media Visualization of Bali Higher Education Electronic Libraries**

Source: Processed from field data for 2020

Figure 6.1 above shows that university electronic libraries in Bali show their existence to users through various media, including social media. The media is a sign that can connect the library with other users or users, so that communication between the two parties is still carried out even though virtually.

The transformation of a conventional library to an electronic library is a process of changing library goods and services (components) so that they have better usability values. Thus, the process of changing the value of a product or goods is called commodification, which by Mosco (2009: 156) is stated as the process of changing goods and services, including communications, which are valued for their usefulness, into commodities that are valued because of what they will provide in the market. Furthermore, Mosco (2009) classifies commodification into 3 (three) types, namely content commodification, audience commodification, and labor commodification. Commodification of content is related to content, commodification of audiences is related to audiences, and commodification of labor is related to workers. In connection with that matter,

Referring to the Mosco commodification theory, electronic library components can cause library commodification. These components are electronic collections such as e-books,
e-journals, and so on, library buildings or rooms, facilities and infrastructure and actors involved in the development of electronic libraries. Electronic collections are worth more than printed collections considering that electronic collections have several advantages such as being able to be read anywhere and anytime, efficient, not requiring a special place, safe and undamaged, easy to back up, comfortable, environmentally friendly and can be marked as a reminder for readers, as stated by Erviantono follows:

The electronic library for me has an important meaning because it is related to my mobility which does not stay in one location when working on my dissertation, so that wherever I need articles from e-journals or e-books I want to be able to access them. (Interview January 8, 2021)

The informant's statement above shows that the convenience possessed by electronic collections causes the collection to be used more by users, so that the electronic collection is part of the commodification of content or content that emphasizes the value or advantages of the content.

Electronic libraries allow users to access at the same time with a large number of accesses and not limited to one location. Thus, an electronic library allows an increase in the number of accesses, so that an electronic library is also a commodification of the audience or audience, considering that the level of access is determined by the number of audiences or people who access it. Electronic library facilities and infrastructure are also part of audience commodification, including electronic library rooms.

From the description above, it can be said that commodification practices can occur in various aspects of life, including electronic libraries. The provision of useful items for users and the process of changing these items in the library provide a clear example that commodification is part of the library. Commodification causes library goods and services to have added value for internal libraries and users. According to Arjun Appadurai in (Ertman, 2005: 35) commodities are basically "everything that is intended to be exchanged," or any object of economic value. Thus, all things in electronic libraries that have a positive impact such as physical, library facilities and services so that they are utilized by users are library commodifications.
CONCLUSION

The practice of power relations in university electronic libraries in Bali is largely determined by the knowledge of library actors. This knowledge plays an important role and has power in the practice of power relations, thus forming an equal relationship between actors. However, the power relations are not always parallel, especially the power relations in the development of collections and the use of electronic library software, so that the power relations become domination, negotiation, and hegemony. Therefore, the power relation of Foucault's perspective cannot always be applied in this study. The practice of power relations has positive implications for actors and institutions, even though this practice creates a gap between librarians, users, and library collections.

REFERENCES


Perpustakaan Nasional RI. (2009) *Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia No. 43 Tahun 2007 Tentang Perpustakaan*. Jakarta: Perpustakaan Nasional RI


Senayan Development Community (2007) *Panduan Penggunaan Senayan Library Management System (SLiMS)*. Sumber: [https://library.unej.ac.id/repository/slims8_doc.pdf](https://library.unej.ac.id/repository/slims8_doc.pdf)