

## **IMPLEMENTATION OF BALI GOVERNOR REGULATION NUMBER 97/2019 THROUGH A POSTMODERN APPROACH STUDY**

Sri Lestari<sup>1</sup>, I Wayan Ardika<sup>2</sup>, I Nyoman Wijaya<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Tri Sadhana Putra Art and Sciences Writing, <sup>2,3</sup>Cultural Studies Study Program,  
Faculty of Arts, Udayana University

Email: [sri.lestari141@gmail.com](mailto:sri.lestari141@gmail.com) , [ardikawayan52@gmail.com](mailto:ardikawayan52@gmail.com), [iwijayastsp@yahoo.co.id](mailto:iwijayastsp@yahoo.co.id)

---

**Received Date** : 2-06-2020  
**Accepted Date** : 21-08-2020  
**Published Date** : 31-08-2020

### **ABSTRACT**

This study talks about the meaning of journalists, intellectuals and cultural observers of the Koster Ace government Governor Regulation No. 97 of 2018 which began to be implemented at the end of 2018. This policy aims to serve as a guideline by the local government of Bali in formulating technical policies in the field of limiting plastic waste generation Disposable (PSP). This phenomenon is studied using a Postmodern approach, so that the methodology, theory, epistemology, and research objectives must be in sync with it. The methodology is taken from a genealogy method which is in sync with Foucault's theory of power relations of knowledge. Assisted by Bourdieu's generative structural theory. The goal is to get an understanding or meaning of the meaning of the regulation. Meaning in studies comes from 'from within' through the point of view of the actors who practice the meaning itself. Every form of meaningful practice is influenced by épistémè, reasoning, and experiences that shape the knowledge of its meaning as conceptualized in Foucault's theory and Bourdieu's cultural capital. Substantially, all interpreters agree that this regulation is one way to overcome the problem of single-use plastic waste (PSP), but there are still many weaknesses when it is implemented in the community. The weakness lies in the absence of an in-depth academic study before the regulation is implemented. As the essence of the conclusion, it can be seen that the meaning of journalists, intellectuals, and humanists for the governorship shows a contestation (struggle or resistance), but in it there is no visible negotiation of the dominant powers. Their meaning can be referred to as a form or reflection of the level of knowledge of each interpreter, which ultimately leads to productive powers towards Pergub No. 97 of 2018.

Keywords: meaning, journalist, intellectual, humanist, governorate

### **INTRODUCTION**

Pergub No. 97 of 2018 began to be implemented at the end of 2018. This policy aims to serve as a guideline by the Bali local government in the formulation of technical policies in

the area of limiting single-use plastic waste (PSP). PSP is all forms of disposable tools / materials made from or containing plastic, synthetic latex (polyethylene), thermoplastic synthetic polymeric materials. This includes plastic bags, polysterina (Styrofoam) and plastic straws. PSP restriction is intended to prevent pollution and environmental damage. The policy is thus expected to guarantee the fulfillment and protection of the right to a good and healthy environment for the community. The long term goal is related to the sustainability of the ecosystem and to ensure that future generations who are not dependent on PSP will achieve a better quality of life.

PSP waste generation restrictions include volume or weight, distribution and usage. This policy has an impact on producers, distributors and business actors. PSP is prohibited from being produced, distributed and supplied. Every business actor and PSP provider is prohibited from providing PSP. Manufacturers, distributors and suppliers are required to use PSP replacement products. The replacement product uses environmentally friendly materials and / or is not disposable. Substitute products that can be used by communities, customary villages, religious institutions, social institutions, private institutions, and government officials, while PSP is prohibited (Pergub No. 97/2018).

This study will examine the meaning of journalists, intellectuals and cultural observers of the regulation. However, the meaning is not interpreted lexically, namely explaining the meaning or purpose of the regulation. The meaning of meaning in this study does not refer to Barker's (2004: 8-9) thinking which is constructed through signs, especially language signs. Language gives meaning to material objects and social practices. According to him, the processes of meaning production are meaningful practices, and understanding culture means exploring how meaning is generated symbolically in language as a system of meaning. It can be called as meaning from outside, which is done by the researcher himself.

The meaning in this study refers to the understanding given by Budiawan (2015: viii-ix), that through the practice of meaning, there is contestation (struggle / resistance) or there can also be negotiations against dominant powers. That is, every practice of meaning results in contestation or struggle, resistance and convergence (Nurkhoiron, 2005: 50), but it could be that a meaning can reproduce the dominant powers. So the meaning in this study comes from 'from within' through the perspective of the actors who practice the meaning itself. Every form of meaningful practice has the same right to be appreciated, in the sense that it is studied academically from the point of view of the actors of the practice of meaning itself (Budiawan,

2015: viii-ix). Actors who practice this meaning are sought after by journalists, intellectuals and humanists.

The purpose of the research was reached by asking a research question how do they interpret Pergub No. 97 of 2018? This question is examined using a postmodern approach. In accordance with the approach used, the methodology, theory and research objectives must conform to it. As said by Della Porta and Keating (2008: 1 in Neuman 2017: 103) the approach is broader than theory or methodology. It also includes the epistemology (questions regarding the theory of knowledge) of research objectives (whether evaluation of understanding, explanation, or normative). Of the three choices, the purpose of this research is to find out the understanding or meaning of journalists, intellectuals and humanists for Pergub No. 97 of 2018.

The use of theory in this study is adapted to the Postmodern approach used. Neuman (2017: 103-140) mentions that there are three major approaches in social science research with their respective methodologies, theories, epistemology, and research objectives, namely positivistic, interpretive, and critical social science approaches. Followed by two other approaches, namely postmodern and feminist social sciences with their respective methodologies, theories, epistemology, and research objectives. Postmodern has roots in the philosophies of existentialism, nihilism, and anarchism as well as in the ideas of Martin Heidegger (1889-1976), Michel Foucault (1926-1984), Friedrich Nietzsche (1844-1900), Jean-Paul Sartre (1905-1980), and Ludwig Wittgenstein (1889-1951).

So, if you are looking for the theories contained in the Postmodern approach, then do not stay away from these thinkers. However, only one is used in this study, namely Foucault combined with Bourdieu. Even though there are those who include Bourdie's theory in the ranks of critical social science theory, he can still be combined with Foucault, because together with Gidden and Garfinkel, he belongs to the practical theory family, which is the hallmark of Foucault (Ritzer, 2014: 107 ). As Foucault said, a statement that is formulated in policy will appear rational when practicing a discussion based on open and free arguments. The meaning of the statement and its rationality does not depend only on language because each partner has a different capital. The meaning of a statement that is formulated in policy is often determined also by factors outside of it (Haryatmoko, 2010: 8).

The value of discourse is determined by the market, depending on the strength relationship between the speaker's language competence (production, appreciation,

appropriation) and the social structure in that interaction. The language structure acts as a distinctive system of sanctions and censorship. The production and circulation of this language results from the habitus and language market. When policies are offered, it is possible to understand mistakes and failures. In relation to the language market, the determination of the meaning of discourse depends on the type of social arena, the accumulation of capital at stake and the habitus that is demanded (Haryatmoko, 2010: 8-9). Practices, according to the schema contained in the history through which it passes, ensure the active presence of the past experiences of actors placed in each organism in the form of schemes of perception, thought and action, especially all formal rules and explicit norms, to ensure their conformity at all times ( developed from the thought of Bourdieu, 1980: 91 in Haryatmoko, 2016: 40)

Thus, as already mentioned above, the determination of meaning in discourse (policy) No.97 of 2018 depends on the formation of the knowledge of the interpreters, which in Bourdieu's term is called capital / cultural capital, meaning that each meaning has different knowledge and capital so as to produce different meanings.

## **RESEARCH METHODS**

As part of qualitative research, this study uses a combination of two methods called to confirm or confirm the other. The two methods are interview methods and reading online media archives in the form of text. Interviews can provide a reinforcement or confirmation of weaknesses found in online media texts (Stokes, 2003: 27-28).

The interview process begins by ensuring access to resources in the planning stage (Stokes, 2003: 33). This access is obtained through social media, especially Facebook, which is an arena for journalists, intellectuals and cultural observers to interact, discuss many things including the concepts of Balinese preservation. Being their best friend is one of the entrances to be able to conduct an interview. The interview guide was guided by Foucault's genealogy method. The genealogy method also contains epistemology, so it can also be called a methodology as practiced by Alba-Juez (2009: 216-219 in Haryatmoko, 2017: 67-79). Research is also needed through secondary sources in the form of literature that is increasingly freely available. The industrial revolution as a result of the increasing use of computer technology has led to some of these changes (Stokes, 2003: 35). In addition, book

publications on Bali preservation are expanding, making it easier to find and find articles related to this research topic.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

Governor Regulation No. 97/2018 concerning the limitation of single-use plastic waste (PSP) has been implemented in the realm of government and retail in Bali. Retail and minimarkets in Bali, especially those with large networks, no longer provide plastic to wrap their customers' shopping items. This rule also applies to small-scale shops and stalls owned by the community. They are advised not to use plastic to wrap food and groceries for their customers. There is a laminated inscription on every cart and on the wall of the warung containing the appeal. The trader has stopped providing plastic bags since the writing was posted. They provide cloth bags for Rp. 2,000 - Rp. 5,000 depending on the size. Kedisan village, Bangli, supports collective support in reducing PSP use. Youth associations routinely carry out mutual cooperation activities to clean plastic waste. The plastic waste collected is handed over to the waste bank. Supporting activities is the arrangement of landscaping around the village (Bali Post, 18 February 2020).

Other villages also provide support for policies to reduce plastic waste. The governor invites all levels of society, government agencies, business actors and all parties to participate in implementing the regulation. This statement was conveyed during the Bali Clean Plastic Waste Declaration. The event was then continued with the Plastic Waste Cleanup Movement which was held in the area of Pura Agung Besakih, Karangasem. The two activities are part of the implementation of Pergub No. 97/2018 which aims to make Bali free from single-use plastic waste. The plastic waste cleaning activity was attended by more than 10 thousand participants from the Bali Province Indonesian Hindu Youth Association (Peradah), the Bali Hindu Dharma Student Association (KMHDI), in collaboration with the Bali provincial government, Kodam IX / Udayana, Bali Regional Police , district / city governments, universities throughout Bali, junior high school / high school students, communities, and communities. This activity is also to welcome the masterpiece of the five guardians of krama. In the five guardians of manners, people who want to pray are not allowed to carry and use plastic (Bali Post, February 3, 2019).

However, behind this support there is a hidden customer as explained below.

### **Hidden Offense**

These hidden violations were found in a number of markets in South Denpasar. A food vendor stated the following:

"Yesterday an officer came and gave an appeal not to use plastic bags anymore. They also put something like this on every cart. It's all installed. No plastic bags. So, for this kilo plastic, it's still okay. Later you can get a fine for buying and selling too. I have provided a cloth bag if (the customer) forgot to bring it myself. It's hot if it's not bagged. " (Field data from a regional satay trader in South Denpasar, 27 March 2019).

A group of vegetable traders and cooked side dishes chose to use plastic kilos as a container for their customers' groceries. Rice snacks, which previously used mica as a wrapper, were replaced with banana leaves or oil paper. However, retail cooked side dishes are still wrapped in small plates and are sold for between three thousand to five thousand rupiah per pack. There are quite a lot of consumers, especially in the morning, before working hours, with a nominal purchase of between fifteen thousand to twenty-five thousand rupiah per person, which is estimated to be enough for three meals, as long as rice is available in each house. The consumers are mainly students, university students, day workers, shop employees, who live in boarding houses, but some are civil servants as seen from the clothes they wear.

On the other hand, the PSP ban policy also intersects with traders of raw side dishes, who sell in markets and stalls. In a number of markets, especially in the South Denpasar area, it is seen that traders want to support government policies on reducing plastic waste. Likewise, a number of her customers, especially mothers, are used to carrying grocery bags, as explained by a young mother:

"Have always brought this woven shopping basket. I spend a lot if I check how much plastic (bag) I have in my hand. With this (shopping cart) will fit a lot. In the wet rain, just dry in the sun. I have also brought this bag (woven bag) to the supermarket. My mother used to shop using a large basket made of woven bamboo, you know what is suwun (how to carry things by lifting them up and placing them on your head). Back then it used to be. " (statement from housewives who shop for vegetables, March 28, 2019).

However, in general, most people still do not have the habit of carrying their own shopping bags, especially those who shop for just one or two items. Usually they only rely on the plastic bags provided by traders, then place them on their motorcycle hangers. There is relatively no awareness in a family to remind each other to bring their own basket when shopping. Incidents like this have happened for many years since the emergence of plastic bags (plastic bags) in the early 1970s. After that year people who go shopping to the market or to the food stall always remember to bring a basket or a bag. Often people also bring a basket and a tablecloth when buying curry. But now there are also a number of people who provide support for this policy, even though they have to build this habit from scratch (interview with Suryani, March 2, 2020).

Traders along the campus road in South Denpasar can feel this policy. Each shop had an announcement not to provide plastic bags. A raw vegetable trader stated that this was the first time there was a government policy that could be directly felt by small people like himself. Government policies generally do not touch the common people, they don't even know it. The regulation on plastic restrictions is felt by the small community. Meatball traders hide plastic bags because they feel sorry for customers who forget to bring shopping bags. Porridge traders provide shopping bags made of cloth to replace plastic bags, although many customers object to having to pay for them.

The loss of the habit of carrying baskets and tablecloths when buying *berkuah* snacks since the 1970s has shaped the Balinese habitus into individuals who prioritize practicality. As stated by Bourdieu (1980: 91, in Haryatmoko, 2016: 40), as a result of history, habitus produces practices, both individually and collectively, according to the scheme contained by history. Habitus actively brings back past experiences that just appear in the form of schemes of perception, thought and action, as well as all formal rules and explicit norms, to ensure the appropriateness of practices over time.

The knowledge contained in Pergub No. 97 of 2018 was actualized by the Badung regional government by issuing a Badung Regent Regulation (Perbup) Number 47 of 2018 concerning Reducing the Use of Plastic Bags. Badung will provide administrative sanctions for violators through the local Environmental and Sanitation Service (LHK). In accordance with the regent's regulation, they will target plastic bag sources, namely shops and other business services. If a violation is found, a written coaching will be carried out which will last

for one month. If violations are found again, they will be given administrative sanctions, which can continue with the suspension of environmental permits such as SPPL or UKL / UP of the business. Furthermore, within three months, if violations are still found, the environmental permit will be revoked (radarwali.jawapos.com, 19 September 2019).

Such regulations are relatively easier to apply to middle to upper level retail stores, but this is not the case for small ones. They still dare to serve buyers by using plastic bags. This actually increases the number of visits to his shop, because consumers who forget to put a cloth bag in the trunk of their motorbike will choose to go shopping to small shops. The socio-economic implications of this kind receive less attention from reporters through online journals. But that does not mean that there are no online journal reporters who dare to give critical meaning to the governor's regulation, but the emphasis is different. In this case the meaning of the reporters contrasts with the intellectuals and cultural observers as explained below.

### **The meaning of journalists, intellectuals and cultural observers**

The domestic and international government interpreted the limitation policy on PSP waste generation as an extraordinary and courageous breakthrough in preserving Bali's nature (Bali Post, January 3, 2020). However, a reporter from Gianyar who gave the meaning independently (not related to his workplace) stated that this policy was only able to reduce but not solve the problem. He interpreted that the policy was indeed able to prohibit the little people from reducing the use of plastic. However, the most disposable plastic users (PSP) are the producers in their products. The policy cannot address the solution to the plastic waste from upstream (interview with I Made Sujaya, 24 November 2019).

In fact, packaged food manufacturers still use plastic as their wrapping, as seen on minimarket shelves. On the other hand, consumers are forced not to use items made from PSP to reduce plastic waste. Therefore, the Governor Regulation No. 97/2018 is interpreted as not educating because it teaches people to get cleanliness instantly. However, the policy immediately received a positive response from the public. The implementation is seen by many people or groups on social media who claim to be anti-plastic waste. A number of communities took action to clean the environment. Public awareness of the environment has begun to rise, but only temporarily (Suardana, tatkala.co, 22 January 2019).

The implementation of the Pergub makes the community frenetic about removing rubbish in their homes, in the temple area and in the environment or cleaning up mangrove areas and mangrove trees. The result is that the area is clean for a while because the garbage piles up again. However, this policy is interpreted as failing to create a cultured society to live cleanly because it does not educate them to live cleanly. This can be seen in the lives of young people at home and in public spaces. They don't seem to care about the trash around them, because they are not used to cleaning up the food waste they eat in stalls or cafes, so that it is scattered on tables and floors (Suardana, *tatkala.co*, 22 January 2019).

This condition shows that cleanliness has not become a community culture. The governor should make a Pergub on a culture of clean living which can be used as a guide for living forever. A Pergub created to construct a clean culture of Balinese society should place the Pergub on a clean living culture as the main objective, then a technical regulation is made for its implementation in various fields of life. The governor who has the authority is expected to make a clean living governor as a policy capable of constructing a better society's culture. If it is only an instant Pergub, the government is interpreted as failing to produce a millennial generation who has a clean culture (Suardana, *tatkala.co*, 22 January 2019).

The meaning contrasts with the meaning of a cultural and intellectual. They interpret Pergub No. 97 of 2018 as giving hope for reducing the negative impact of PSP waste and creating a positive effect on the preservation of Bali. The impact of environmental damage and pollution can also be controlled by reducing the use of PSP. However, these efforts are not accompanied by the provision of substitute materials which are commensurate and more practical. Therefore the regulation is interpreted as a step that is not serious because it will be difficult to reduce the use of PSP if there is no substitute material that is of comparable quality and is more practical. Until now, plastic bags have been inexpensive and mass-available packaging.

The substitute materials for PSP that are offered by the government are, for example, paper bags or cloth bags, but they are not yet available in bulk and the price cannot be cheaper than plastic. The same thing happened to the alternative packaging made from PSP in foods that were replaced with, for example, leaves, but its availability was limited. Inequality in the implementation of the rules has begun to appear. In the substance of the title Pergub No. 97/2018 clearly states that there is a limitation on PSP waste generation, but the implementation in the field is a ban on the provision and use of PSP.

This Pergub is interpreted as regulating many producers, distributors and suppliers as well as modern shops, especially in Article 7 they are prohibited from producing, distributing and supplying PSP. Government Regulation (PP) No. 18/1999 needs to pay attention, especially the statement regarding waste, namely the residue of a business or activity. Pergub No. 97/2018 needs synchronization with PP No. 18/1999 so that steps to reduce the generation of plastic waste materials do not only touch individuals or communities but also business actors.

The use of PSP is still common in traditional markets for example for wrapping fresh fish, meat, cooking oil, shrimp paste, fresh fruit and snacks. On the other hand, PSP disposal channels contained in factory products such as instant noodles, candy, shampoo, and the like. Therefore, seriousness in handling PSP waste generation must be done by providing plastic replacement materials and preparing a clear disposal channel for plastic waste materials (Muliarta, beritabali.com, January 3, 2019).

The policy for limiting PSP waste generation apart from being out of sync with PP. 18/1999 as mentioned above is also Law no. 18/2008 and Article 612 of the Civil Code (KUH). Bali provincial government is interpreted as not carrying out the mandate of Law no. 18/2008 on waste management. The government should not make a policy to prohibit the use of PSP products but carry out or make a policy of reducing and managing waste from unused products by issuing regulations. The substance of these regulations emphasizes the implementation of regulations to be carried out by district / city governments in Bali. Article 612 of the Civil Code means that buyers are guaranteed the right to receive shopping bags. Shopping bags are the obligation of merchants to serve consumers by having to deliver their merchandise to buyers in real terms. Plastic / shopping bags are goods that are an obligation for a seller to wrap his merchandise so that it can be enjoyed by a buyer. The plastic bag is a tool from the seller which is provided free of charge that arises from the legal pattern of sale and purchase, not from the buyer. Pergub No. 97/2018 thus contradicts Article 612 of the Civil Code (H. Asrul Hoesein, kompasiana.com, 13 January 2019).

Contest (struggle) for meaning between the government and the PSP entrepreneurs mentioned above continues. The Plastic Recycling Association (ADUPI) interpreted that the ban on PSP violates human rights (HAM) because it has a negative impact on the income of their business entities and the work of plastic scavengers. Different interpretations of the

director of Amnesty International Indonesia and the researcher of the "Indonesian Center for Environmental Law" stated that the ban on PSP is not a violation of human rights.

This policy actually embodies an economic, social and cultural right, namely the right to a good and healthy environment. This right is part of the realization of the right to health and the right to just and favorable working conditions. Three types of PSP in Pergub No. 97/2018 is classified as a plastic that cannot or is difficult to recycle and its contents cause environmental conditions that endanger human health. This is exacerbated by the absence of an adequate recycling system in Bali. The Break Free From Plastic (BFFP) movement states 8.3 billion metric tons of plastic have been produced since the 1950s. Recent BFFP research shows only 9 percent of that figure is actually recycled plastic. A total of 12 percent of plastic waste is burned, while the remaining 80 percent ends up in landfills, the sea, or the surrounding environment. Micro-plastics that contain toxins are thus directly or indirectly exposed to humans through animal or plant consumption.

The toxins in micro-plastics can threaten human health. The PSP ban policy is thus needed in Bali to create a good and healthy environment. This must be realized by the state, including local governments, as a commitment to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ECOSOB).

"The ECOSOB Covenant obliges states to pay attention to the right to the highest standard of physical and mental health (Article 12 paragraph 1) and to take effective steps to realize this right, including improving environmental and industrial hygiene (Article 12 paragraph 2.d.). The UN Commission on ECOSOB Rights explained that this obligation includes the prevention and reduction of people's vulnerability from harmful materials (Article 12 paragraph 2 letter b). For example, radiation and hazardous chemicals or environmental conditions that are harmful, either directly or indirectly, which have an impact on a person's health." (Usman Hamid and Annisa Erou, tirta.id, 24 May 2019).

The aforementioned rights are also contained in the 1945 Constitution as a constitutional right, namely in Article 28H paragraph 1 that 'Every person has the right to live in physical and mental well-being, residing and having a good and healthy living environment and the right to obtain health services.' In the Protection Law and Environmental Management (UU PPLH) No. 32 of 2009 supports the previous regulation that "Everyone has the right to a good and healthy environment as part of human rights." This is confirmed in Law no. 39/1999 HAM Article 9 paragraph 3 states that "Everyone has the right to a good and healthy

environment" (Usman Hamid and Annisa Erou, *tirto.id*, 24 May 2019). The plaintiff's Pergub policy No. 97/2018 states that human rights violations are also in the category of the right to work and do business. The prohibition on the consumption of PSP results in losses for producers because the products are not purchased. The absence of PSP waste will also reduce job opportunities for scavengers. The right to decent work is recognized in international human rights law, namely Article 6 of the Covenant on Economic and Social Rights and is guaranteed in Article 28D paragraph 2 of the 1945 Indonesian Constitution.

The right to work in Article 4 of the Covenant does not include an absolute right or that cannot be reduced in contrast to the right to a healthy and good environment. PPLH Law No. 32/2009 Article 1 Letter n states that regional autonomy is one of the principles of environmental protection by taking into account regional specificities and diversity. In addition, there is also a precautionary principle (Article 2 Letter f) which encourages steps to minimize or avoid threats to environmental pollution and damage. Local governments are allowed to take steps in order to avoid threats to environmental pollution, even though they will be affected by certain businesses or activities. The regional government is thus given the mandate to limit the right to work or income on the basis of avoiding the threat of environmental pollution. In terms of work, it is necessary to pay attention to the Covenant on the ECOSOB Rights, Articles 7a-ii and 7b emphasize that everyone has the right to a profession that provides decent living for themselves and their families with healthy and safe working conditions. This statement is in line with the 1945 Constitution Article 27 paragraph (2) that "every citizen has the right to a job and a decent living for humanity." The right to decent work does not exist in the scavenger profession that is championed by the plaintiffs for Pergub No. 97/2018.

Scavengers work in landfills (TPA) which are not hygienic, safe, or humane. The work situation of scavengers that does not meet proper standards is a homework for the government to open jobs according to national and international human rights standards. The PSP permit on the grounds of providing employment for scavengers and PSP producers is interpreted as having the same logic as allowing narcotics to work for dealers and rehabilitation officers. PSP restriction is related to creating a healthy environment (Usman Hamid and Annisa Erou, *tirto.id*, 24 May 2019). Contest (struggle) the meaning of Pergub No. 97/2018 mentioned above has reached the Supreme Court (MA). The policy is submitted in the application for judicial review. Application for judicial review of Pergub No. 97/2018 was

proposed by Didie Tjahjadi, a PSP goods trading business actor and Agus Hartono Budi Santoso, a PSP goods industry player (Nusa Bali, 12 July 2019). The Supreme Court rejected the request for judicial review in the Supreme Court Decision Number 29 P / HUM / 2019 (Nusa Bali, 12 July 2019; and Ichwan Susanto, Kompas, 11 July 2019). In the interpretation of a reporter who spoke independently, it was stated that the limitation of single-use plastic waste showed concern for the preservation of nature starting from small things. These policies are rules in the form of recommendations and prohibitions as interpreted by the general public. This policy, however, is one of the government's successes in realizing the vision of preserving nature (interview with Agus Putra Mahendra, 13 November 2019).

Plastic waste takes millions of years to decompose in nature but is used all the time. After the policy has been running for six months (December 2018- June 2019) it is still unclear when the administrative sanctions for violators will be implemented. The head of the Bali Province Environment Agency said it was not certain when the sanctions in the policy would be applied. The agency stated that it was still in the socialization stage for Pergub No.97 / 2018, including to modern shops, schools and traditional markets. The socialization stage is also balanced with coordination with district / city governments to equalize perceptions so that there is no difference in meaning (bali.idntimes.com, 20 June 2019). There is also the meaning of a teacher whose meaning has a meeting point with the meaning of a number of reporters above. If the use of waste cannot be avoided, considering that all products are wrapped in plastic from the factory, what must be done is not to ban the use of plastic, but how to manage it so that it is efficient. Therefore, the waste disposal channel must be arranged from the house by sorting organic and non-organic waste with different colored wrappers.

The cleaners only need to sort out the bags containing organic waste and those that are not. The color of the wrapper is regulated, for example a black wrapper is for organic waste, while a red one is for non-organic waste. This method will also help cleaners often function as garbage collectors. It would be great if Bali had a single-use plastic waste recycling factory (interview with Ni Nyoman Suryani, 2 March 2020).

Apart from those that are critical as mentioned above, there are also interpretations that use compromise lines as explained below.

### **Pathways of Compromise**

The Deputy Regent of Tabanan, I Komang Gede Sanjaya, actualized Pergub No. 97 of 2018 by visiting Tabanan Market to reduce the use of plastic bags, which took place on March 2, 2019. He socialized reducing plastic waste accompanied by the distribution of hundreds of cloth bags, as reported by Made Nurbawa, an intellectual from Tabanan, a keen on agricultural culture. He said the existence of Tabanan Market was not only the center of the economy but also a source of cultural and historical knowledge. The market in Bali in general is not only a meeting place between supply and demand, but also to respect all forms of the creation of the Almighty in a variety of products. In Tabanan Market, you can see the diversity of residents, traders and buyers from various regions and origins. They are united and side by side looking for a living, but also united in their beliefs as seen in the worship of Pura Melanting. In this market, one can also learn about the nature of diversity, unity, democracy, including the real implementation of Bhinneka Tunggal Ika and the economic principles of Pancasila. Meanwhile, in terms of historical knowledge, traces of civilization and development can be studied in downtown Tabanan.

Furthermore, there are no critical observations regarding socio-economic conditions in the market. He tells about the history of the Tabanan market and the history of Tabanan City, which is not enough for one day to peel it. However, according to at least the socialization of reducing the use of plastic bags by the Deputy Regent of Tabanan can be used as a reminder that in the future it is necessary to make arrangements and policies in response to environmental issues, using a multi-dimensional approach, both political, legal, economic and socio-cultural.

The emergence of such interpretations shows the depth of the cultural capital of the reporter. One of the important elements in cultural capital is the ability to write which is integrated with diplomas, knowledge, cultural codes, ways of speaking, ways of characterizing, ways of socializing that play a role in determining the writer's social position in society (Bourdieu, 1994: 20-46, 56, 130; 1980: 214-215 in Haryatmoko: 2016: 45).

The ability to write is also determined by taste. This means that his writing, which does not pay attention to whether or not there are hidden violations of the small traders in the Tabanan traditional market, is related to tastes, both personal and the media that support them. Taste does not necessarily mean the choice of type of food, quantity and method of eating, but it can be broader than that including the choice of news from a journalist or the media that covers it. As said by Bourdieu (in Haryatmoko; 2016: 48) taste also shows which

social class a person belongs to. Likewise, the way of appearance, how to choose the materials used also characterizes behavior, self-confidence, and determines relationships. So there is domination in it hidden.

According to Bourdieu (in Johnson, 2015: ix-x) systems of domination find expression in all areas of cultural practice and symbolic exchange, covering such things as how to choose clothes, how to choose sports, how to choose food, how to choose music, how to choose literature, how to choose art, and so on, which in this case also includes how reporters choose and write news, how to choose, shape and set their tastes. Taste not only classifies the object to be selected, but also classifies its classification. Social subjects are classified by their own classifications, distinguishing themselves according to their own distinctions, such as between the beautiful and the ugly: the closed and the vulgar, referring to whether their position in the objective classifications is expressed or betrayed.

So the reporter's taste is neutral, because Bourdieu (in Haryatmoko, 2016: 48) is a disposition (attitude, a tendency to perceive, feel, do and think which is interiorized) obtained to be able to distinguish and appreciate. The recognition of objects is guaranteed without having to demand distinctive knowledge to define it specifically. The sense of guiding the practices of life is as if it can free itself from values, because it is part of the habitus. Even though taste is not separated from the basic principles of construction and evaluation of the social world. As with other habitus, taste plays a very important role in the division of labor (between class, age, sex). Taste operates as a kind of social orientation, directing a person in a social position (Haryatmoko, 2016: 48).

In this regard, the similarity of taste in news and news sources is considered important. In Bourdieu's thought (Haryatmoko, 2016: 49), this is related to the class division model which defines predictable space or distance, thus enabling encounter, relationship, sympathy or even desire. More concretely, tastes can be used to determine the opportunity to meet, so that it is easy to understand each other because there are no more differences in their cultural backgrounds or habits. This closeness of the social sphere allows for closeness in terms of possessions, dispositions and tastes. They find it easier to approach each other, and be moved to one another. Such a basis for thinking is very useful in understanding the emergence of alternative thoughts which show that the preservation of Bali Koster-Ace has broad implications in society as explained below.

### **Alternative Thinking**

Alternative thoughts that are seen in the contestation (wrestling) of Pergub No. 97 of 2018 are also part of the taste, which is in accordance with the access that a person has in cultural activities. As part of the representation system, intellectuals who provide alternative meanings to Bali Koster-Ace conservation policies are determined by their access to certain cultural activities which according to Bourdieu (Haryatmoko, 2016: 54-54) are basically not equal, in accordance with ownership of social capital. The desire to be different according to Bourdieu (Haryatmoko, 2016: 55) is an attempt to show a social position within the framework of the assessment construction mechanism. There are codes and discourses that they master that arise because of the social environment that is strengthened by the school, which is reflected in the inequality of access and differences in assessment. Their preference for something, in this case Balinese language and script, reflects ownership of a certain social environment.

What they have and the choice of types of words expressed in the Bourdieu language (Haryatmoko, 2016: 55) is not only meaningful, but also related to relationships with other parties in an effort to maintain their position as Balinese language and literature expert or climb the ladder of ownership. social environment. They are trapped in people's judgments which are usually based on a direct relationship between their educational background (scientific) and their social role in society. According to Bourdieu, behind the idea of judging free and competent people, there is an ideology of talent in which is hidden what determines the tastes of society and perpetuates relations of domination.

The tastes shown by the interpreters who show alternative thoughts in interpreting Pergub No. 97 of 2018 show the strength of the norms of an inner talent ideology. With this habitus through habitus, a world of common sense is created, a social world that seems like it should be. Many people who understand the existence of the Balinese Age language find additional reasons that the Bali conservation regulation launched by the Koster-Ace government is indeed weak and lacks competence, especially regarding problems.

The description above shows that the meaning in this sub-section shows that there are meanings who are not aware of the *épistémè* and some are aware, but all are able to show the existence of power relations in the *perda*. As said by Foucault (Adian, 2002: 23) together with experience and reasoning, *épistémè* which shapes people's knowledge. *Épistémè* is untouchable. The way it works is very subtle, mastering the mindset of people at one time

and kicking alternative thought patterns. Its mechanism of action is discursive. This means that three discursive components, namely disciplines, institutions, and figures determine how a phenomenon is categorized, defined, and followed up (Adian, 2002: 23).

On the basis of their knowledge, as already mentioned above, most of the interpreters interpret Pergub No. 97 of 2018 as less strategic. According to them, there are still many solutions that must be taken to solve the problem of plastic waste. First, the governor should make a Pergub on a clean culture that can be used as a guide for life.

Second, the regulation on clean living culture as the main goal, then made technical rules for implementation in various fields of life. Third, the impact of environmental damage and pollution can indeed be controlled by reducing the use of PSP, but paper bags or cloth bags are not yet available in bulk and the price cannot be cheaper than plastic.

Fourth, the prohibition of PSP consumption results in losses for producers because the products are not purchased. Fifth, the absence of PSP waste will also reduce job opportunities for scavengers. Sixth, what should be done is not banning the use of plastics, but rather how to manage plastic waste. The description above shows that the meaning in this sub-section shows a contestation (struggle) that is stronger when compared to other sub-chapters, there are those whose knowledge is still not aware of their *épistémè* and some are aware, but all are able to show power relations in the local regulation. In Foucault's (2002: 176) thought, the power relations in the governor's regulation appear to 'really serve,' but they are not at all 'serving' economic interests as the main thing, but because society has the potential to be used in strategies. which exists. But there are no power relations without obstacles, because they are formed by the point where the power relations are carried out. Barriers to power do not have to come from something real or love for power itself, but these obstacles are present everywhere along with the power itself, as revealed in the above meanings.

## **CONCLUSION**

Substantially, all interpreters agree that this regulation is one way to solve the problem of single-use plastic waste (PSP), but there are still many weaknesses when it is implemented to the community. The problem lies in the absence of an in-depth academic study before this regulation is implemented.

Academically, this research has succeeded in obtaining an understanding or meaning of journalists, intellectuals and cultural observers of Pergub No. 97/2018. This success cannot be separated from the use of Foucault's theory as a basis for thinking, so that answers to the research questions of this study can be obtained that the differences in the meanings of journalists, intellectuals, and cultural observers are influenced by the results of meetings or crosses between *épistémè*, experience, and reasoning. their knowledge embedded in the social, historical, economic, and moral thought of their time. Meanwhile, by using Bourdieu as a basis for thinking, the answer is obtained that the knowledge that shapes their meaning of the governorate is the cultural capital / capital that is formed from their habitus from childhood.

As a summary of the conclusion, it can be seen that the meaning of journalists, intellectuals, and humanists towards Pergub No. 97/2018 shows a contestation (struggle or resistance), but in it there is no negotiation of dominant powers. Their meaning can be called a manifestation or reflection of their respective levels of knowledge, which ultimately leads to productive powers towards Pergub No. 97/2018.

## **SUGGESTION**

There is a need for consistency in conducting cultural studies based on a postmodern approach. This approach plays a very large role in guiding the methodology, theory, epistemology, and research objectives. Doing research through an approach turns out to be not simple, but at least get a clear understanding that a research study, must confirm the method used and that too must be guided by the approach chosen.

The postmodern approach is not the only approach used in Cultural Studies. There is still another approach, namely critical social science. However, the methodology, theory, epistemology and research objectives are different. Of course, the theories used are still around critical social theory, which can be used to discuss real power relations, power that has an owner (as contained in Gramsci's theory) not an abstract one, which is everywhere as contained in Foucault's theory. . If you use a critical social science approach, of course the final results of this study will also be different. Finally, to the related parties, even though this research is only one of the sub-sectors of Bali Koster-Ace conservation, the results of this study can be expected as material for self-introspection, that a policy requires in-depth study before being implemented.

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

Thank you to institutions that provide access to online data sources and literature so that this research can be carried out in covid-19 conditions. And also to informants who have made time for interviews at the right moment. Especially for Udayana University institutions which have helped administratively in the research process. Thank you also to the lecturers of the Masters in Cultural Studies at Udayana University.

## **REFERENCES**

- "2020, Gubernur Koster Optimalisasi Penerapan Pergub dan Perda." *Bali Post*. 3 Januari 2020.
- Adian, Donny Gahral. 2002. "Berfilsafat Tanpa Sabuk Pengaman: Sebuah Pengantar." Dalam Rabinow Paul. *Pengetahuan dan Metode: Karya-karya Penting Michel Foucault*. (terj. Arief). Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Barker, Chris. 2014. *Cultural Studies Teori dan praktik*. (Trj. Tim KUNCI CSC). Yogyakarta: Pt Bentang Pustaka.
- Budiawan, ed. 2015. *Media [Baru], Tubuh, dan Ruang Publik: Esei-esai Budaya dan Media*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Dayu Swasrina. "Nangun Sat Kerthi Loka Bali: Desa Adat Kedisan Lestarikan Tari Sakral." *Bali Post*. 18 Februari 2020.
- Foucault, Michel. 2002. *Power/Knowledge: Wacana Kuasa/Pengetahuan, Wawancara Pilihan dan Tulisan-tulisan Lain 1972-1977*. (terj. Yudi Santosa). Yogyakarta: Bentang Budaya.
- "Gubernur Bali Menang Perkara Sampah Plastik di Mahkamah Agung." *Nusa Bali*. 12 Juli 2019.
- Hamid, Usman dan Annisa Erou. "Pelarangan Plastik Bukan Pelanggaran HAM." *Tirto.id*. 24 Mei 2019. <https://tirto.id/pelarangan-plastik-bukan-pelanggaran-ham-dQTA>. diakses 30 Oktober 2019.
- Haryatmoko. 2010. *Dominasi Penuh Muslihat: Akar Kekerasan dan Diskriminasi*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama
- Haryatmoko. 2016. *Membongkar Rezim Kepastian: Pemikiran Kritis Post-Strukturalis*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius.
- Haryatmoko. 2017. *Critical Discourse Analysis (Analisis Wacana Kritis) Landasan Teori, Metodologi dan Penerapan*. Jakarta: Rajawali Press.

- Hoesein, H Asrul. "Menyoal Larangan Kantong Plastik di Bali." *kompasiana.com*. 13 Januari 2019.  
<https://www.kompasiana.com/hasrulhoesein/5c3ae729710c363/menyoal-larangan-kantong-plastik-di-bali>. diakses 30 Januari 2020.
- Mustofa, Ali. ed. "Nekat Belanja Pakai Kantong Plastik di Badung, Siap-siap Kena Sanksi." *Radarbali.jawapos.com*. 19 September 2019.  
<https://radarbali.jawapos.com/read/2019/09/19/156469/nekat-belanja-pakai-kantong-plastik-di-badung-siap-siap-kena-sanksi>. diakses 29 Oktober 2019.
- Neuman, W. Lawrence. 2017. *Metodologi Penelitian Sosial: Pendekatan Kualitatif dan Kuantitatif*. (terj. Edina T. Sofia). Jakarta: PT Indeks.
- Nurkhoiron, Mochammad. 2005. "Agama dan Kebudayaan: Menjelajahi Isu Minoritas dan Multikulturalisme di Indonesia." Dalam Hikmat Budiman ed. *Hak Minoritas: Dilema Multikulturalisme di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Yayasan Interseksi.
- "Pergub Pengurangan Sampah Plastik Belum Jelas Penerapan Sanksi di Bali." <https://bali.idntimes.com/news/bali/imamrosidin/pergub-pengurangan-sampah-plastik-belum-jelas-penerapan-sanksi-di-bali/full>, 20 Juni 2019. Diakses 25 November 2019.
- Randal, Johnson. 2015. "Pengantar Pierre Bourdieu tentang Seni, Sastra, dan Budaya." Dalam Pierre Bourdieu. *Arena Produksi Kultural: Sebuah Kajian Sosiologi Budaya*. (terj. Yudi Santoso). Yogyakarta: Kreasi Wacana.
- Ritzer, George. 2014. *Teori Sosiologi Modern Edisi Ketujuh*. (Terj. Triwibowo B.S.) Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group.
- Stokes, Jane. 2003. *How To Do Media and Cultural Studies*. London: Sage Publications.
- Suardana, Gde. "Pergub Anti Sampah Plastik adalah Pergub Instan." *Tatkala.co*. 22 Januari 2019. <https://tatkala.co/2019/01/22/pergub-anti-sampah-plastik-adalah-pergub-istan/>. diakses 30 Januari 2020.
- Suardana, Gde. "Pergub Anti Sampah Plastik adalah Pergub Instan." *Tatkala.co*. 22 Januari 2019. <https://tatkala.co/2019/01/22/pergub-anti-sampah-plastik-adalah-pergub-istan/>. diakses 30 Januari 2020.
- Susanto, Ichwan. "MA Menolak Uji Materi Peraturan Gubernur Bali Soal Plastik Sekali Pakai." *Kompas*. 11 Juli 2019. <https://kompas.id/baca/utama/2019/07/11/ma-menolak-uji-materi-peraturan-gubernur-bali-soal-plastik-sekali-pakai/>. diakses 30 Oktober 2019.